

Expert Searchers' Contributions to Evidence-Based Health Policy Making

Min-Lin E. Fang,¹ Penny Coppernoll-Blach,² Gail Persily,¹ Keir Reavie,¹ David Owen,¹
Alice Witkowski²

1. University of California, San Francisco, Kalmanovitz Library and Center for Knowledge Management
2. University of California, San Diego, Biomedical Library

UC Librarians Work on California Legislative Bills



Introduction

- The California Health Benefits Review Program (CHBRP) was established in 2002 following passage of AB 1996. This legislation directs the University of California Office of the President to respond to requests from the California State Legislature for independent analyses of the medical, financial, and public health impacts of proposed health insurance mandates.
- In 2004 librarians at UCSF began providing evidence-based literature searches in support of CHBRP's independent analyses.
- Each analysis includes an estimate of the bill's cost and summarizes sound scientific evidence relevant to the proposed bill and defers policy decision-making to the Legislature.

Team Collaboration

- CHBRP staff at UC Office of President
- Faculty Task Force
 - Medical Effectiveness Team: the Institute for Health Policy Studies at UCSF
 - Public Health Impacts Team: UC Berkeley
 - Cost Impacts Team: UC Los Angeles and actuaries/consultants at Milliman USA
- Librarians
 - Started with UCSF in 2004
 - Expanded to UCSF and UCSD in 2005
 - Expanded to UCSF, UCSD, UCD, UCI in 2006
- National Advisory Council of experts from outside the state
- Strictly comply with a conflict-of-interest policy

Librarian's Role

- Work closely with the Medical Effectiveness Team and the content expert to:
 - develop search strategies specific to the mandate
 - conduct the literature searches given inclusion/exclusion criteria
 - filter search results and forward relevant abstracts of peer-reviewed literature to the Medical Effectiveness Team for review and selection
 - assist with any additional searches if needed and with obtaining full text articles
 - complete literature searches within 4-5 days

Literature Searching Processes

UCSF Librarians and the Medical Effectiveness Team developed a template for conducting literature searches and a hierarchical method for evaluating evidence of medical effectiveness.

- Hierarchy of Literature Review
 - Meta-analyses
 - Systematic reviews
 - Evidence-based guidelines
 - Individual randomized clinical trials
 - Observational studies
 - Case-control studies
 - Clinical/practice guidelines based on consensus or opinion, rather than on evidence

Source: Institute for Health Policy Studies, School of Medicine University of California, San Francisco.
California Health Benefits Review Program Medical Effectiveness Template. 2004

How a Bill Becomes a Law in CA



Outcomes of 2005 Analyses

Bill Number	Topic	Completed Date	Analysis Date
AB 1276	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1277	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1278	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1279	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1280	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1281	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1282	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1283	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1284	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1285	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1286	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1287	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1288	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1289	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1290	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1291	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1292	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1293	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1294	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1295	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1296	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1297	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1298	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1299	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05
AB 1300	Health Insurance Premiums	12/15/05	12/15/05

CHBRP Completed Analyses, 2005
(AB 1996 Implementation Report)
<http://www.chbrp.org/implementation.html>

Current 2006 Proposed Bills

- AB 2281 High Deductible Health Plans & Preventive Services
- AB 2012 Orthotic and Prosthetic Devices
- SB 1245 Cervical Cancer Screening Test
- SB 1508 Propofol for Colonoscopies
- SB 1223 Hearing Aids for Children
- AB 264 Pediatric Asthma Education

Librarian Time Commitment

- Participate in conference calls
- Read background information
- Define the search scope
- Conduct literature searches in appropriate databases
- Run additional searches based on feedback or changes of bill's intent
- Record all search terms
- Time: 8-48 hours per bill

Challenges

- Workload
 - Strict deadline (4-5 days) for completion
 - Unpredictability of receipt of requests and workload impact
 - Workload ongoing when amended bills require additional searches
- Searching
 - Ambiguous intent of the bill makes it difficult to define search scopes and strategies
 - Considerable amount of time spent in filtering the search results for relevancy
- Collaboration
 - Working with teams with different needs (medical effectiveness, cost impact, public health impact)
 - Working by conference call with 24 participants
 - Managing expectations of researchers and educating them about librarian's role

Conclusions

- Librarians welcomed this opportunity to work with faculty and researchers in many disciplines from multiple campuses.
- Librarians increased their knowledge and understanding of the California legislative process and issues related to health insurance benefits.
- Librarians played a significant role in expert retrieval and evaluation of information in support of evidence-based clinical, scientific and health policy decision making.
- Librarian's unique expertise was recognized and valued by the researchers.

CHBRP Website



www.chbrp.org

Comments from CHBRP

- "The UC librarians made an invaluable contribution to CHBRP's analyses. Our reports were greatly enhanced due to their efforts. The librarians worked very efficiently under tight deadlines. They all did a fantastic job for CHBRP!"
- "I really appreciate your work on these projects. It is so much easier with a professional helping us out..."
- "Thanks for your contribution... Having you involved from the very beginning really helps get the work off the ground quickly and efficiently!"