# **FONTIERS** RESEARCH TOPICS



# CLOSING THE LOOP AROUND NEURAL SYSTEMS

Topic Editors Steve M. Potter, Ahmed El Hady and Eberhard E. Fetz





#### FRONTIERS COPYRIGHT STATEMENT

© Copyright 2007-2014 Frontiers Media SA. All rights reserved.

All content included on this site, such as text, graphics, logos, button icons, images, video/audio clips, downloads, data compilations and software, is the property of or is licensed to Frontiers Media SA ("Frontiers") or its licensees and/or subcontractors. The copyright in the text of individual articles is the property of their respective authors, subject to a license granted to Frontiers.

The compilation of articles constituting this e-book, wherever published, as well as the compilation of all other content on this site, is the exclusive property of Frontiers. For the conditions for downloading and copying of e-books from Frontiers' website, please see the Terms for Website Use. If purchasing Frontiers e-books from other websites or sources, the conditions of the website concerned apply.

Images and graphics not forming part of user-contributed materials may not be downloaded or copied without permission.

Individual articles may be downloaded and reproduced in accordance with the principles of the CC-BY licence subject to any copyright or other notices. They may not be re-sold as an e-book.

As author or other contributor you grant a CC-BY licence to others to reproduce your articles, including any graphics and third-party materials supplied by you, in accordance with the Conditions for Website Use and subject to any copyright notices which you include in connection with your articles and materials.

All copyright, and all rights therein, are protected by national and international copyright laws.

The above represents a summary only. For the full conditions see the Conditions for Authors and the Conditions for Website Use.

ISSN 1664-8714 ISBN 978-2-88919-356-1 DOI 10.3389/978-2-88919-356-1

## **ABOUT FRONTIERS**

Frontiers is more than just an open-access publisher of scholarly articles: it is a pioneering approach to the world of academia, radically improving the way scholarly research is managed. The grand vision of Frontiers is a world where all people have an equal opportunity to seek, share and generate knowledge. Frontiers provides immediate and permanent online open access to all its publications, but this alone is not enough to realize our grand goals.

## FRONTIERS JOURNAL SERIES

The Frontiers Journal Series is a multi-tier and interdisciplinary set of open-access, online journals, promising a paradigm shift from the current review, selection and dissemination processes in academic publishing.

All Frontiers journals are driven by researchers for researchers; therefore, they constitute a service to the scholarly community. At the same time, the Frontiers Journal Series operates on a revolutionary invention, the tiered publishing system, initially addressing specific communities of scholars, and gradually climbing up to broader public understanding, thus serving the interests of the lay society, too.

## **DEDICATION TO QUALITY**

Each Frontiers article is a landmark of the highest quality, thanks to genuinely collaborative interactions between authors and review editors, who include some of the world's best academicians. Research must be certified by peers before entering a stream of knowledge that may eventually reach the public - and shape society; therefore, Frontiers only applies the most rigorous and unbiased reviews.

Frontiers revolutionizes research publishing by freely delivering the most outstanding research, evaluated with no bias from both the academic and social point of view.

By applying the most advanced information technologies, Frontiers is catapulting scholarly publishing into a new generation.

## WHAT ARE FRONTIERS RESEARCH TOPICS?

Frontiers Research Topics are very popular trademarks of the Frontiers Journals Series: they are collections of at least ten articles, all centered on a particular subject. With their unique mix of varied contributions from Original Research to Review Articles, Frontiers Research Topics unify the most influential researchers, the latest key findings and historical advances in a hot research area!

Find out more on how to host your own Frontiers Research Topic or contribute to one as an author by contacting the Frontiers Editorial Office: researchtopics@frontiersin.org

# CLOSING THE LOOP AROUND NEURAL SYSTEMS

**Topic Editors:** 

**Steve M. Potter,** Georgia Institute of Technology, USA **Ahmed El Hady,** Max Planck Institute for Dynamics and Self Organization, Germany **Eberhard E. Fetz,** University of Washington, USA



Closing the loop around neural systems: most commonly used words. This word cloud was generated using all the keywords, titles, authors' affiliations, and abstracts from this Research Topic. The font size is proportional to the number of times the word was used.

Closed-loop neurophysiology has been accelerated by recent software and hardware developments and by the emergence of novel tools to control neuronal activity with spatial and temporal precision, in which stimuli are delivered in real time based on recordings or behavior. Real-time stimulation feedback enables a wide range of innovative studies of information processing and plasticity in neuronal networks. This Research Topic e-Book comprises 16 Original Research Articles, seven Methods Articles, and seven Reviews, Mini-Reviews, and Perspectives, all peer-reviewed and published in Frontiers in Neural Circuits. The contributions deal with closed loop neurophysiology experiments at a variety of levels of neural circuit complexity. Some include modeling and theoretical analyses. New enabling technologies and techniques are described. Novel work is presented from experiments in vitro, in vivo, and in humans, along with their clinical and technological implications for improving the human condition.

# Table of Contents

07	<i>Closed-Loop Neuroscience and Neuroengineering</i> Steve M. Potter, Ahmed El Hady and Eberhard E. Fetz
10	Carbon Nanotube-Based Multielectrode Arrays for Neuronal Interfacing: Progress and Prospects
	Lilach Bareket-Keren and Yael Hanein,
<i>26</i>	Nanowire Electrodes for High-Density Stimulation and Measurement of Neural
	Circuits
	Jacob T. Robinson, Marsela Jorgolli, and Hongkun Park
31	High-Density Microelectrode Array Recordings and Real-Time Spike Sorting for
	Closed-Loop Experiments: An Emerging Technology to Study Neural Plasticity
	Felix Franke, David Jäckel, Jelena Dragas, Jan Müller, Milos Radivojevic,
	Douglas Bakkum and Andreas Hierlemann
38	Sub-Millisecond Closed-Loop Feedback Stimulation Between Arbitrary Sets of
	Individual Neurons
	Jan Müller, Douglas J. Bakkum and Andreas Hierlemann
<b>49</b>	Closed-Loop, Multichannel Experimentation Using the Open-Source
	NeuroRighter Electrophysiology Platform
	Jonathan P. Newman, Riley Zeller-Townson, Ming-Fai Fong, Sharanya Arcot Desai
	Robert E. Gross and Steve M. Potter
67	In Vitro Large-Scale Experimental and Theoretical Studies for the Realization of
	Bi-Directional Brain-Prostheses
	Paolo Bonifazi, Francesco Difato, Paolo Massobrio, Gian L. Breschi,
	Valentina Pasquale, Timothée Levi, Miri Goldin, Yannick Bornat,
	Mariateresa Tedesco, Marta Bisio, Sivan Kanner, Ronit Galron,
	Jacopo Tessadori, Stefano Taverna and Michela Chiappalone
86	Modular Neuronal Assemblies Embodied in a Closed-Loop Environment:
	Toward Future Integration of Brains and Machines
	Jacopo Tessadori, Marta Bisio, Sergio Martinoia, and Michela Chiappalone
102	Toward a Self-Wired Active Reconstruction of the Hippocampal Trisynaptic
	Loop: DG-CA3
	Gregory J. Brewer, Michael D. Boehler, Stathis Leondopulos, Liangbin Pan,
	Sankaraleengam Alagapan, Thomas B. DeMarse and Bruce C. Wheeler
110	Adaptive Enhancement of Learning Protocol in Hippocampal Cultured
	Networks Grown on Multielectrode Arrays
	Alexey Pimashkin, Arseniy Gladkov, Irina Mukhina and Victor Kazantsev

- 119 Restoration of Upper Limb Movement Via Artificial Corticospinal and Musculospinal Connections in a Monkey with Spinal Cord Injury Yukio Nishimura, Steve I. Perlmutter and Eberhard E. Fetz
- **128** Closing the Loop in Primate Prefrontal Cortex: Inter-Laminar Processing Ioan Opris, Joshua L. Fuqua, Peter F. Huettl, Greg A. Gerhardt, Theodore W. Berger, Robert E. Hampson and Sam A. Deadwyler
- 141 Decreased Hering-Breuer Input-Output Entrainment in a Mouse Model of Rett Syndrome

Rishi R. Dhingra, Yenan Zhu, Frank J. Jacono, David M. Katz, Roberto F. Galán and Thomas E. Dick

- 152 Vesicular Stomatitis Virus with the Rabies Virus Glycoprotein Directs Retrograde Transsynaptic Transport Among Neurons in Vivo Kevin T. Beier, Arpiar B. Saunders, Ian A. Oldenburg, Bernardo L. Sabatini and Constance L. Cepko
- 165 Spatial Vision in Insects is Facilitated by Shaping the Dynamics of Visual Input Through Behavioral Action

Martin Egelhaaf, Norbert Boeddeker, Roland Kern, Rafael Kurtz and Jens P. Lindemann

188 Closed-Loop Response Properties of a Visual Interneuron Involved in Fly Optomotor Control

Naveed Ejaz, Holger G. Krapp and Reiko J. Tanaka

199 The Iso-Response Method: Measuring Neuronal Stimulus Integration with Closed - Loop Experiments

Tim Gollisch and Andreas V. M. Herz

213 Statistics of Neuronal Identification with Open- and Closed-Loop Measures of Intrinsic Excitability

Ted Brookings, Rachel Grashow and Eve Marder

- **227** Nonlinear Dynamical Model Based Control of in Vitro Hippocampal Output Min-Chi Hsiao, Dong Song and Theodore W. Berger
- 241 Controlling the Oscillation Phase through Precisely Timed Closed-Loop Optogenetic Stimulation: A Computational Study Annette Witt, Agostina Palmigiano, Andreas Neef, Ahmed El Hady, Fred Wolf and Demian Battaglia
- **258** Adaptive Stimulus Optimization for Sensory Systems Neuroscience Christopher DiMattina and Kechen Zhang
- 274 A Hebbian Learning Rule Gives Rise to Mirror Neurons and Links them to Control Theoretic Inverse Models

A. Hanuschkin, S. Ganguli and R. H. R. Hahnloser

289 Real-Time System for Studies of the Effects of Acoustic Feedback on Animal Vocalizations

Mike Skocik and Alexay Kozhevnikov

295 Learning and Exploration in Action-Perception Loops Daniel Y. Little and Friedrich T. Sommer

- **314** Neural Control and Adaptive Neural Forward Models for Insect-Like, Energy-Efficient, and Adaptable Locomotion of Walking Machines Poramate Manoonpong, Ulrich Parlitz and Florentin Wörgötter
- **342** Control of Breathing by Interacting Pontine and Pulmonary Feedback Loops Yaroslav I. Molkov, Bartholomew J. Bacak, Thomas E. Dick and Ilya A. Rybak
- 360 The Response Clamp: Functional Characterization of Neural Systems Using Closed-Loop Control

Avner Wallach

367 A Translational Platform for Prototyping Closed-Loop Neuromodulation Systems

Pedram Afshar, Ankit Khambhati, Scott Stanslaski, David Carlson, Randy Jensen, Dave Linde, Siddharth Dani, Maciej Lazarewicz, Peng Cong, Jon Giftakis, Paul Stypulkowski and Tim Denison

382 Dynamic Control of Modeled Tonic-Clonic Seizure States with Closed-Loop Stimulation

Bryce Beverlin II and Theoden I. Netoff

- *Assisted Closed-Loop Optimization of SSVEP-BCI Efficiency* Jacobo Fernandez-Vargas, Hanns U. Pfaff, Francisco B. Rodríguez and Pablo Varona
- **406** Coupling BCI and Cortical Stimulation for Brain-State-Dependent Stimulation: Methods for Spectral Estimation in the Presence of Stimulation After-Effects Armin Walter, Ander R. Murguialday, Wolfgang Rosenstiel, Niels Birbaumer and Martin Bogdan
- 423 Erratum: Coupling BCI and Cortical Stimulation for Brain-State-Dependent Stimulation: Methods for Spectral Estimation in the Presence of Stimulation After-Effects

Armin Walter, Ander Ramos Murguialday, Martin Spüler, Georgios Naros, Maria Teresa Leão, Alireza Gharabaghi, Wolfgang Rosenstiel, Niels Birbaumer and Martin Bogdan

## Closed-loop neuroscience and neuroengineering

## Steve M. Potter<sup>1</sup>\*, Ahmed El Hady<sup>2</sup> and Eberhard E. Fetz<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Laboratory for Neuroengineering, Coulter Department of Biomedical Engineering, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA, USA

<sup>2</sup> Department of Non Linear Dynamics, Max Planck Institute for Dynamics and Self Organization, Goettingen, Germany

<sup>3</sup> Departments of Physiology and Biophysics and Bioengineering, Washington National Primate Research Center, University of Washington, Seattle, WA, USA

\*Correspondence: steve.potter@bme.gatech.edu

#### Edited and reviewed by:

Florian Engert, Harvard University, USA

Keywords: feedback, real-time, BCI, microelectrode array, CMOS, DBS, stimulation

Feedback and closed-loop circuits exist in just about every part of the nervous system. It is curious, therefore, that for decades neuroscientists have been probing the nervous system in an openloop manner to understand it. Instead of the linear, reductionistic "stimulate  $\rightarrow$  record response" approach, a more modern approach is taking hold: closed-loop neuroscience. It respects the inherent "loopiness" of neural circuits, and the fact that the nervous system is embodied, and embedded in an environment. Through active sensing, behaving animals can influence their environment in ways that alter subsequent sensory inputs. Therefore, loops abound not only in the nervous system itself, but through its dynamic interactions with the world. By interposing our own technology in some of these loops, we can achieve unprecedented control over the system being studied and explore the functional consequences. This Research Topic, "Closing the Loop Around Neural Systems," presents a diverse set of recent methodological, scientific and theoretical advances from neuroscientists and neuroengineers who are pioneering closed-loop neuroscience.

As shown here, cutting-edge researchers are taking advantage of real-time or "on-line" processing of large streams of neural data. This has become feasible thanks to advances in computer processing power, in electronics such as microprocessors and field-programmable gate arrays (FPGAs), and in specialized and open-source software. These advances have enabled a wide variety of new neuroscience approaches to understanding, modulating, and interfacing with the nervous system—approaches in which the variables being monitored can influence the experiment in progress, just as active sensing can influence an animal's next input.

Our call for submissions to this Frontiers in Neural Circuits Research Topic yielded an overwhelming response, indicating that closing the loop around neural systems is an exciting and rapidly expanding field. Perhaps this is because of the diversity of ways in which "closed-loops" can be interpreted and implemented. This Research Topic presents seven Methods articles, 16 Original Research articles, and seven Reviews, Mini-Reviews, and Perspectives, for a total of 30 accepted papers published in Frontiers in Neural Circuits between April 2012 and October 2013. A map showing the locations of all the contributors<sup>1</sup> reveals that most are in the USA and Europe, although researchers in Russia, Japan, and Israel are also represented.

Several articles describe or review new technologies that increase the options for closed-loop neuroscience. Two papers by Bareket-Keren and Hanein (2013) and Robinson et al. (2013) review the latest in carbon nanotube and nanowire multielectrode arrays (MEAs) for neural interfacing. Franke et al. (2012) review high-density MEAs with many electrodes and realtime spike sorting. Müller et al. (2013) present sophisticated hardware and software for very fast (sub-millisecond) closedloop recording and stimulation of cultured networks using their CMOS array with 11,011 electrodes. Newman et al. (2013) created an application programming interface (API) for their open-source NeuroRighter electrophysiology system that greatly enhances its ability to carry out closed-loop experiments in which recorded signals trigger electrical stimulation or other hardware. Five examples of closed loop experiments in vitro and in vivo are described.

A number of articles present advances using acute or cultured networks *in vitro*. Bonifazi et al. (2013) present EU Brain Bow project efforts in progress, to create and study bi-directional neural interfaces. Their work includes both patterned dissociated cultures and their responses to laser ablation, and a whole-brain *in vitro* preparation and its response to focal ischemia. The goal is to develop the closed-loop prostheses of the future. Tessadori et al. (2012) present their Hybrain2 software for real-time control of hybrid neural-robotic systems, consisting in this case of a virtual wheeled robot interfaced to a living hippocampal network on an MEA. Brewer et al. (2013) reconstructed a hippocampal trisynaptic loop *in vitro* on an MEA with small tunnels for neurites to grow through. Pimashkin et al. (2013) used an adaptively enhanced learning protocol to study learning in dissociated hippocampal networks on MEAs.

Others studied the nervous systems of intact or semi-intact animals with closed-loop approaches. Nishimura et al. (2013) restored arm movements in a spinal cord-injured non-human primate (NHP) with an artificial cortico-spinal connection and an artificial musculo-spinal connection. This system allows volitional control and boosting of weak, residual muscle activity. Opris et al. (2012) enhanced performance on a delayed match-tosample task in NHPs using cortical microstimulation contingent on recordings that predict incorrect responses. Dhingra et al. (2013) studied the role of the vagal mechanosensory feedback

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>See: https://mapsengine.google.com/map/edit?mid=zDBeK\_5W8FVs.knb4\_z5h9NpQ

loop for respiration in a perfused *in situ* brainstem preparation of a mouse model for Rett syndrome. To help map the brain's feedback loops, Beier et al. (2013) demonstrate in the mouse a new transsynaptic retrograde tracer, based on the vesicular stomatitis virus with a rabies virus coat. Egelhaaf et al. (2012) provide a comprehensive review of work on insect vision, emphasizing the importance of active sensing for interpreting optic flow to optimize flying. Ejaz et al. (2013) present closed-loop experiments to study fly visual circuits in which recorded neural responses control a fast turntable on which the fly is mounted. Gollisch and Herz (2012) review how the locust auditory system, salamander retina, and the monkey visual cortex have been used to efficiently explore a large parameter space of iso-response curves, via on-line analysis of incoming data to generate the next stimuli.

The "Model-in-the-loop" paradigm is a powerful approach to understanding complex neural network dynamics. Brookings et al. (2012) interfaced an excised crab stomatogastric ganglion (STG) to a dynamic clamp model neuron to help determine the relative contributions of intrinsic and network properties of STG neurons to network function. Hsiao et al. (2013) interfaced a dentate gyrus-CA1 model to an acute hippocampal slice preparation on an MEA, with the goal of developing cognitive prostheses that could someday replace damaged brain regions.

Theoretical advances are described in several modeling and simulation papers. Witt et al. (2013) modeled the ability of closed-loop optogenetic stimulation to control communication between neural populations by altering their phase relationships. DiMattina and Zhang (2013) reviewed the use of feedback to optimize stimuli continuously during an experiment, for realtime model estimation. Hanuschkin et al. (2013) modeled the sensory-motor loop by which birds learn to produce stereotyped songs. Skocik and Kozhevnikov (2013) demonstrate a system for real-time audio feedback to study birdsong learning. Little and Sommer (2013) optimized exploration strategies in embodied agents based on information-theoretic analysis. Manoonpong et al. (2013) demonstrate the value of adaptive forward models in developing a legged robot locomotion controller. Molkov et al. (2013) modeled the roles of local (brainstem) and distal (lungs) feedback in mammalian respiratory circuits. Wallach (2013) reviews the concept and implementation of a response clamp, in which closed-loop control of a selected neural response variable is used to uncover network properties in cultured networks.

On the clinical side, Afshar et al. (2013) describe and test a new platform for closed-loop deep brain stimulation (DBS). This is the beginning of "smart neuromodulators" that tune themselves to provide optimal benefit to those suffering from, for example, epilepsy or Parkinson's disease. Beverlin and Netoff (2013) present theoretical analysis of a model neural network, aimed at closed-loop seizure control with just such a smart DBS device. Fernandez-Vargas et al. (2013) explored closed-loop optimization of a flickering light display as part of a visually-evoked potential (VEP) brain-computer interface that could be used by locked-in patients to communicate. Walter et al. (2012, 2013) explored transcranial cortical magnetic stimulation (TMS) in a motor task in 3 paralyzed stroke patients wearing a mechatronic hand orthosis. TMS was triggered by recorded brain states that were processed

in real time for spectral estimation and to deal with stimulation artifacts.

The diversity of methods, experiments, tools, and analyses in this Research Topic suggests that many more areas of neuroscience research would benefit from adopting a closed-loop perspective.

### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

Many thanks to all the authors and to the many reviewers who helped make this an outstanding set of articles!

#### **REFERENCES**

- Afshar, P., Khambhati, A., Stanslaski, S., Carlson, D., Jensen, R., Linde, D., et al. (2013). A translational platform for prototyping closed-loop neuromodulation systems. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:117. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00117
- Bareket-Keren, L., and Hanein, Y. (2013). Carbon nanotube-based multielectrode arrays for neuronal interfacing: progress and prospects. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:112. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00122
- Beier, K. T., Saunders, A. B., Oldenburg, I. A., Sabatini, B. L., and Cepko, C. L. (2013). Vesicular stomatitis virus with the rabies virus glycoprotein directs retrograde transsynaptic transport among neurons *in vivo*. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:11. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00011
- Beverlin, B. II., and Netoff, T. I. (2013). Dynamic control of modeled tonic-clonic seizure states with closed-loop stimulation. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:126. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00126
- Bonifazi, P., Difato, F., Massobrio, P., Breschi, G. L., Pasquale, V., Levi, T., et al. (2013). *In vitro* large-scale experimental and theoretical studies for the realization of bi-directional brain-prostheses. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:40. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00040
- Brewer, G. J., Boehler, M. D., Leondopulos, S., Pan, L., Alagapan, S., Demarse, T. B., et al. (2013). Toward a self-wired active reconstruction of the hippocampal trisynaptic loop: DG-CA3. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7, 165–165. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00165
- Brookings, T., Grashow, R., and Marder, E. (2012). Statistics of neuronal identification with open- and closed-loop measures of intrinsic excitability. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:19. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00019
- Dhingra, R. R., Zhu, Y., Jacono, F. J., Katz, D. M., Galan, R. F., and Dick, T. E. (2013). Decreased hering-breuer input-output entrainment in a mouse model of rett syndrome. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:42. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00042
- DiMattina, C., and Zhang, K. (2013). Adaptive stimulus optimization for sensory systems neuroscience. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:101. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013. 00101
- Egelhaaf, M., Boeddeker, N., Kern, R., Rafael, K., and Lindemann, J. P. (2012). Spatial vision in insects is facilitated by shaping the dynamics of visual input through behavioral action. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:108. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00108
- Ejaz, N., Krapp, H. G., and Tanaka, R. J. (2013). Closed-loop response properties of a visual interneuron involved in fly optomotor control. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:50. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00050
- Fernandez-Vargas, J., Pfaff, H. U., Rodriguez, F. B., and Varona, P. (2013). Assisted closed-loop optimization of SSVEP-BCI efficiency. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:27. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00027
- Franke, F., Jaeckel, D., Dragas, J., Müller, J., Radivojevic, M., Bakkum, D., et al. (2012). High-density microelectrode array recordings and real-time spike sorting for closed-loop experiments: an emerging technology to study neural plasticity. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:105. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00105
- Gollisch, T., and Herz, A. V. M. (2012). The iso-response method: measuring neuronal stimulus integration with closed loop experiments. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:104. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00104
- Hanuschkin, A., Ganguli, S., and Hahnloser, R. H. R. (2013). A hebbian learning rule gives rise to mirror neurons and links them to control theoretic inverse models. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:106. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00106
- Hsiao, M.-C., Song, D., and Berger, T. W. (2013). Nonlinear dynamical model based control of *in vitro* hippocampal output. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:20. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00020
- Little, D. Y., and Sommer, F. T. (2013). Learning and exploration in actionperception loops. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:37. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00037

- Manoonpong, P., Parlitz, U., and Woergoetter, F. (2013). Neural control and adaptive neural forward models for insect-like, energy-efficient, and adaptable locomotion of walking machines. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:12. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00012
- Molkov, Y. I., Bacak, B. J., Dick, T. E., and Rybak, I. A. (2013). Control of breathing by interacting pontine and pulmonary feedback loops. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:16. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00016
- Müller, J., Bakkum, D. J., and Hierlemann, A. (2013). Sub-millisecond closed-loop feedback stimulation between arbitrary sets of individual neurons. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:121. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00121
- Newman, J. P., Zeller-Townson, R., Fong, M.-F., Desai, S. A., Gross, R. E., and Potter, S. M. (2013). Closed-loop, multichannel experimentation using the open-source NeuroRighter electrophysiology platform. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:98. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00098
- Nishimura, Y., Perlmutter, S. I., and Fetz, E. E. (2013). Restoration of upper limb movement via artificial corticospinal and musculospinal connections in a monkey with spinal cord injury. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:57. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00057
- Opris, I., Fuqua, J. L., Huettl, P. F., Gerhardt, G. A., Berger, T. W., Hampson, R. E., et al. (2012). Closing the loop in primate prefrontal cortex: interlaminar processing. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:88. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012. 00088
- Pimashkin, A., Gladkov, A., Mukhina, I., and Kazantsev, V. (2013). Adaptive enhancement of learning protocol in hippocampal cultured networks grown on multielectrode arrays. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:87. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013. 00087
- Robinson, J. T., Jorgolli, M., and Park, H. (2013). Nanowire electrodes for highdensity stimulation and measurement of neural circuits. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:38. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00038
- Skocik, M., and Kozhevnikov, A. (2013). Real-time system for studies of the effects of acoustic feedback on animal vocalizations. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:111. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00111
- Tessadori, J., Bisio, M., Martinoia, S., and Chiappalone, M. (2012). Modular neuronal assemblies embodied in a closed-loop environment: toward future

integration of brains and machines. Front. Neural Circuits 6:99. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00099

- Wallach, A. (2013). The response clamp: functional characterization of neural systems using closed-loop control. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:5. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00005
- Walter, A., Murguialday, A. R., Rosenstiel, W., Birbaumer, N., and Bogdan, M. (2012). Coupling BCI and cortical stimulation for brain-state-dependent stimulation: methods for spectral estimation in the presence of stimulation after-effects. *Front. Neural Circuits* 6:87. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2012.00087
- Walter, A., Murguialday, A. R., Spueler, M., Naros, G., Leao, M. T., Gharabaghi, A., et al. (2013). Erratum: coupling BCI and cortical stimulation for brainstate-dependent stimulation: methods for spectral estimation in the presence of stimulation after-effects (vol 6, pg 87, 2012). *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:6. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00006
- Witt, A., Palmigiano, A., Neef, A., EI Hady, A., Wolf, F., and Battaglia, D. (2013). Controlling the oscillation phase through precisely timed closed-loop optogenetic stimulation: a computational study. *Front. Neural Circuits* 7:49. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2013.00049

**Conflict of Interest Statement:** The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Received: 03 December 2013; accepted: 01 September 2014; published online: 23 September 2014.

Citation: Potter SM, El Hady A and Fetz EE (2014) Closed-loop neuroscience and neuroengineering. Front. Neural Circuits 8:115. doi: 10.3389/fncir.2014.00115 This article was submitted to the journal Frontiers in Neural Circuits.

Copyright © 2014 Potter, El Hady and Fetz. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) or licensor are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.