Endemic Cardiovascular Diseases of the Poorest Billion

Gene F. Kwan, MD, MPH; Bongani M. Mayosi, MBChB, DPhil; Ana O. Mocumbi, MD, PhD;J. Jaime Miranda, MD, MSc, PhD; Majid Ezzati, PhD; Yogesh Jain, MD; Gisela Robles, DPhil; Emelia J. Benjamin, MD, ScM; S. V. Subramanian, PhD; Gene Bukhman, MD, PhD

Abstract—The poorest billion people are distributed throughout the world, though most are concentrated in rural sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia. Cardiovascular disease (CVD) data can be sparse in low- and middle-income countries beyond urban centers. Despite this urban bias, CVD registries from the poorest countries have long revealed a predominance of nonatherosclerotic stroke, hypertensive heart disease, nonischemic and Chagas cardiomyopathies, rheumatic heart disease, and congenital heart anomalies, among others. Ischemic heart disease has been relatively uncommon. Here, we summarize what is known about the epidemiology of CVDs among the world's poorest people and evaluate the relevance of global targets for CVD control in this population. We assessed both primary data sources, and the 2013 Global Burden of Disease Study modeled estimates in the world's 16 poorest countries where 62% of the population are among the poorest billion. We found that ischemic heart disease accounted for only 12% of the combined CVD and congenital heart anomaly disabilityadjusted life years (DALYs) in the poorest countries, compared with 51% of DALYs in high-income countries. We found that as little as 53% of the combined CVD and congenital heart anomaly burden (1629/3049 DALYs per 100000) was attributed to behavioral or metabolic risk factors in the poorest countries (eg, in Niger, 82% of the population among the poorest billion) compared with 85% of the combined CVD and congenital heart anomaly burden (4439/5199 DALYs) in high-income countries. Further, of the combined CVD and congenital heart anomaly burden, 34% was accrued in people under age 30 years in the poorest countries, while only 3% is accrued under age 30 years in high-income countries. We conclude although the current global targets for noncommunicable disease and CVD control will help diminish premature CVD death in the poorest populations, they are not sufficient. Specifically, the current framework (1) excludes deaths of people <30 years of age and deaths attributable to congenital heart anomalies, and (2) emphasizes interventions to prevent and treat conditions attributed to behavioral and metabolic risks factors. We recommend a complementary strategy for the poorest populations that targets premature death at younger ages, addresses environmental and infectious risks, and introduces broader integrated health system interventions, including cardiac surgery for congenital and rheumatic heart disease. (Circulation. 2016;133:2561-2575. DOI: 10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.116.008731.)

Key Words: cardiomyopathies ■ cardiovascular diseases ■ congenital heart disease ■ epidemiology ■ global health ■ health equity ■ poverty ■ rheumatic heart disease

Worldwide, the burden of cardiovascular disease (CVD), and some of their behavioral and metabolic risk factors, have taken center stage in noncommunicable disease (NCD) policy.^{1,2} The endemic burden of CVD among the world's poorest billion people, however, has been overlooked in global discussions. Epidemiological transition models based on the profiled causes of deaths related to CVD describe a progression from diseases of pestilence and famine to delayed degenerative diseases as countries develop economically.³ Here we focus specifically on what is known about the endemic CVDs

of pestilence and famine that are still part of the unfinished agenda for people living in extreme poverty. A systematic review of all available data on cardiovascular health among the poorest billion is beyond the scope of our article. We conclude with a series of research and policy recommendations to improve cardiovascular health among the poorest people.

Who Are the Poorest Billion?

The 2 most commonly used approaches for measuring poverty are (1) 1-dimensional approaches focused on income or

Circulation is available at http://circ.ahajournals.org

From Department of Medicine, Boston University School of Medicine, MA (G.F.K.); Department of Global Health and Social Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA (G.F.K., G.B.); Partners In Health, Boston, MA (G.F.K., G.B.); Department of Medicine, Groote Schuur Hospital and University of Cape Town, South Africa (B.M.M.); Universidade Eduardo Mondlane and the Instituto Nacional de Saúde, Maputo, Mozambique (A.O.M.); Department of Medicine, School of Medicine Universidad Peruana Cayetano Heredia, Lima, Peru (J.J.M.); CRONICAS Center of Excellence in Chronic Diseases, Universidad Peruana Cayetano Heredia, Lima, Peru (J.J.M.); CRONICAS Center of Excellence in Chronic Diseases, Universidad Peruana Cayetano Heredia, Lima, Peru (J.J.M.); MRC-PHE Centre for Environment and Health, and Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, School of Public Health, Imperial College London, UK (M.E.); Jan Swasthya Sahyog, Village and Post Ganiyari, Bilaspur (Chhattisgarh), India (Y.J.); Oxford Department of International Development, University of Oxford, UK (G.R.); Department of Epidemiology, Boston University School of Public Health, MA (E.J.B.); Department of Social and Behavioral Sciences, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, MA (S.V.S.); and Division of Global Health Equity, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Boston, MA (G.B.).

The online-only Data Supplement is available with this article at http://circ.ahajournals.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA. 116.008731/-/DC1.

Correspondence to Gene F. Kwan, MD, MPH, Boston University Medical Center, 88 East Newton St, D8, Boston, MA 02118. E-mail genekwan@bu.edu © 2016 American Heart Association, Inc.

wealth and (2) multidimensional approaches that attempt to provide a fuller picture by integrating information including education, health, and assets. Both approaches suggest that, in absolute numbers, the world's poorest billion are concentrated largely in rural sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia – though there are differences.^{4.5} In 2012, there were ≈ 1 billion individuals worldwide living an income of < US\$2.05 per day adjusted for 2011 purchasing power parity. By this income measure, around 41% of the poorest billion lived in sub-Saharan Africa; and another 37% lived in South Asia in 2012; and another 18% lived in East Asia, mainly in the rural Western China. About 4% of the poorest billion lived in Latin America and the Caribbean (Table I in the online-only Data Supplement).⁴

The Multidimensional Poverty Index, the most commonly used multidimensional method, integrates poverty measures from 10 indicators in 3 major dimensions: education, health, and living standards.6 Multidimensional poverty measures allow assessment of both monetary and nonmonetary poverty. In rural China, for example, ≈40% of households were poor by Multidimensional Poverty Index, but not poor by income thresholds.⁷ People with a weighted deprivation score of $\geq 44.4\%$ comprise the poorest billion population across the globe. The location of the poorest billion using national-level (Figure 1, Table I in the online-only Data Supplement), and regional-level (Figure 2) data are shown. Subnational disaggregation shows the heterogeneous distribution of the poor. Further disaggregation of multidimensional poverty at the individual level (Table II in the online-only Data Supplement) shows that 54% of the poorest billion are concentrated in South Asia, whereas another 38% reside in sub-Saharan Africa. The remaining 8% are spread throughout East Asia and the Pacific (5%), the Arab States (1%), and Latin America and the Caribbean (1%). Niger is the country with the highest proportion of its population (82%) included within the poorest billion. Although the Multidimensional Poverty Index is comprehensive of three-quarters of the world's population, there are important limitations to its representativeness.⁸ Countries without recent population surveys (since 2004) are excluded from analysis. Most significantly, Western China

was excluded from subnational analysis because of lack of large representative recent surveys. A more detailed discussion is in the online-only Data Supplement.

Primary Data on the CVDs of the Poorest Billion

There are 3 main sources of primary information about CVD and its risk factors among the world's poorest billion people: (1) cardiovascular registries from facilities serving populations living in extreme poverty; (2) verbal autopsy studies of deaths in the poorest populations; and (3) population-based risk-factor surveys. The primary sources frequently lack individual socioeconomic information. In addition, there are few population health examination surveys in low-income populations that go beyond traditional CVD risk factors.

Facility-Based CVD Registries

Evidence from hospital registries in regions with a high concentration of the poor reveals a CVD epidemiology that is different from high-income settings. For comparison, in the First National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey in the United States, >60% of the population attributable risk for congestive heart failure was attributable to coronary heart disease.9 In contrast, Table 1 shows the findings from heart failure registries from facilities likely to include a significant proportion of patients living in extreme poverty. We found registries from 12 countries in sub-Saharan Africa in addition to Haiti since 1996.¹⁰⁻²⁷ Even the registries share an urban or referral bias (only Rwanda had echocardiographic data from a secondary [district] hospital in a rural area).12 Within a previous systematic review of heart failure studies, there were no published registries from geographic areas with high concentrations of extreme poverty within South Asia and Western China.28

Several patterns emerge from the African and Haitian registries. First, the causes of heart failure in the series are much more diverse than in high-income settings. The causes include hypertensive heart disease, cardiomyopathies, rheumatic heart disease, pericardial disease, and congenital heart anomalies.



Figure 1. Poorest billion people identified at country level: Winter 2015.⁸ The map shows the 29 poorest countries identified by the Winter 2015 Global Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI \geq 0.283). The countries were home to 1.1 billion people, using 2011 population figures. The red colors indicate the percentage of a country's population who are poor (individual MPI-weighted deprivation score \geq 33.3%). The darkest red indicates the 16 poorest countries, each with \geq 69.6% of population who are multidimensionally poor. Data for Algeria and Myanmar are older than 2004 and not included.



Figure 2. Poorest billion people identified at subnational level: Winter 2015.⁸ The map colors shows the percentage of people in a subnational region who are multidimensionally poor (individual MPI-weighted deprivation score ≥33.3%). Haiti and the Dominican Republic are shown in the Inset. Countries and regions for which subnational data are not available or whose data are older than 2005 are not included in the analysis. MPI indicates multidimensional poverty index.

Second, ischemic heart disease (IHD) is relatively infrequent. For example, of 3908 cases of CVD in Malawi, only 3 patients had myocardial infarction.¹⁹ Third, rural regions tend to have higher frequency of nonischemic cardiomyopathies and rheumatic heart disease relative to urban centers.

Of the recent anatomic autopsy series published from sub-Saharan Africa, IHD is generally infrequent at 3% to 6%.^{29–31} In 1 series in Nairobi, IHD was found in 25% of patients whose family requested an autopsy, primarily to settle medical insurance claims, and is likely not representative of the poor.³²

Verbal Autopsy Studies

In settings where most people die at home without clinical evaluation, verbal autopsy is a widely used tool to estimate cause of death based on interviews with caretakers and family members. The current 2014 World Health Organization Verbal Autopsy Standards include the following broad CVD categories: (1) acute (ischemic) cardiac disease, (2) cerebrovascular disease, and (3) other and unspecified cardiac disease.³³ There is potential for wide uncertainty and misclassification because the accuracy for verbal autopsy in comparison with clinical diagnosis may be <50%.^{34,35} The INDEPTH network recently reviewed the results of verbal autopsy studies from 22 Health and Demographic Surveillance sites in predominantly rural, low-income settings.³⁶ The review shows that verbal autopsy studies report substantial variation in the ratio of estimated agestandardized nonischemic to ischemic cardiovascular mortality. The proportion of cardiac deaths due to IHD - as opposed to nonischemic causes - ranged widely from 7% to 85% across the verbal autopsy studies (Table III in the online-only Data Supplement). Nonetheless, despite the limitations in identifying CVD cause of death, verbal autopsy remains a valuable tool for population-based assessment in many regions.

Population-Based Risk-Factor Surveys

One of the greatest drivers of IHD risk is age.³⁶ Populations living in extreme poverty appear to be quite young because of high fertility rates. For example, in the poorest 16 countries in 2012, 84% of the population was <40 years of age.³⁷ For comparison, in more developed regions only \approx 50% of the population was <40 years of age.³⁷ IHD risk typically rises exponentially only after 40 years of age.³⁸

Population health surveys measuring CVD risk factors often include some form of socioeconomic information, allowing CVD risk data to be disaggregated by some measure poverty.^{39,40} The complex patterns by geographic region are also instructive. Total tobacco exposure is relatively low in sub-Saharan Africa and poor regions of South America. However, even in sub-Saharan Africa, current smoking appears to be more prevalent among the poor and less educated than among wealthier populations.⁴¹ However, the number of cigarettes consumed per smoker is lower in rural than in urban areas.⁴² In South Asia, cigarette use is relatively low, particularly among women, although alternative forms of tobacco (bidis and oral tobacco) are more common.^{41,43} In China, smoking prevalence is very high among men: higher in rural (56%) than urban (49%) settings, and higher in western China (59%) than other regions.⁴⁴

Age-standardized mean systolic blood pressures in sub-Saharan Africa, particularly Central and Southern Africa, is among highest in the world, and has been rising.⁴⁵ Blood pressure as assessed in multinational community-based surveys is generally lower in rural regions than in urban regions.³⁹ The Prospective Urban Rural Epidemiology (PURE) study is a 17-country cohort including countries across the income spectrum. In low-income countries, prevalence of hypertension is high in rural settings (31.5%), although it is higher in urban areas (44.4%).⁴⁶ Awareness, treatment, and control of

Table 1. Heart Failure Registries in Sub-Saharan Africa and Haiti Since 1996. Percent of Diagnosed Heart Failure Cases by Category for Each Image: Category for Each

| Author | Country | Year | Setting | N | Age* | HTN HD, % | CMP, % | RHD, % | IHD, % | Peric, % | CHA, % | Right HF, % | EMF, % | Other, % |
|--|--|------|---------|-------|------|-----------|----------|----------|--------|----------|--------|----------------|--------|----------|
| Rural | | | | | | | <u>.</u> | <u>.</u> | | | | | | |
| Tantchou Tchoumi et al ¹⁰ | Cameroon | 2011 | Rural | 462 | 43 | 15 | 32 | 34 | - | 7 | 3 | 8 | _ | - |
| Kwan et al ¹¹ | Haiti | 2016 | Rural | 81 | 50 | 7 | 64 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 1 | - | - | 20 |
| Kwan et al ¹² | Rwanda | 2013 | Rural | 192 | 35 | 6 | 41 | 32 | - | 5 | 15 | - | 1 | - |
| Total (rural)† | | | Rural | 735 | | 12 | 38 | 30 | 0.1 | 6 | 6 | 5 | 0.3 | 2 |
| Urban | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Jingi et al ¹³ | Cameroon | 2013 | Urban | 1252 | N/A | 42 | 31 | 3 | 2 | 7 | 2 | - | - | 13 |
| Damasceno et al. (THESUS-HF) ¹⁴ | Cameroon Ethiopia Kenya Mozambique Nigeria Senegal South Africa Sudan Uganda | 2012 | Urban | 1006 | 52 | 45 | 29 | 14 | 8 | 7 | _ | _ | 1 | 7 |
| Kingue et al ¹⁵ | Cameroon | 2005 | Urban | 167 | 57 | 54 | 26 | 25 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 8 | 3 | 1 |
| Amoah et al ¹⁶ | Ghana | 2000 | Urban | 572 | 42 | 21 | 11 | 20 | 10 | - | 10 | - | 4 | - |
| Bloomfield et al ¹⁷ | Kenya | 2016 | Urban | 125 | 61 | 12 | 28 | 18 | 18 | - | - | 8 | - | 16 |
| Oyoo et al18 | Kenya | 1999 | Urban | 91 | 55 | 18 | 25 | 32 | 2 | 13 | 2 | 8 | - | - |
| Soliman et al ¹⁹ | Malawi | 2008 | Urban | 3908 | 40 | 24 | 19 | 30 | <1 | 14 | 4 | | | 8 |
| Ojji et al ²⁰ | Nigeria | 2009 | Urban | 340 | 51 | 63 | 19 | 7 | - | 2 | - | 2 | 1 | 6 |
| Ojji et al ²¹ | Nigeria | 2013 | Urban | 475 | N/A | 61 | 24 | 9 | - | - | - | 3 | - | 3 |
| Onwuchekwa et al ²² | Nigeria | 2009 | Urban | 423 | 54 | 56 | 12 | 4 | _ | - | - | 2 | - | 13 |
| Ansa et al ²³ | Nigeria | 2008 | Urban | 245 | N/A | 37 | 34 | 13 | - | - | - | - | - | 16 |
| Thiam et al ²⁴ | Senegal | 2003 | Urban | 170 | 50 | 34 | 7 | 45 | 18 | - | - | - | _ | _ |
| Stewart et al ²⁵ | South Africa | 2008 | Urban | 844 | 55 | 33 | 28 | 8 | 9 | - | - | 14 | - | - |
| Makubi et al ²⁶ | Tanzania | 2014 | Urban | 427 | 55 | 45 | 28 | 12 | 9 | - | - | - | - | 6 |
| Freers et al ²⁷ | Uganda | 1996 | Urban | 406 | N/A | 9 | 10 | 14 | 1 | - | 18 | - | 24 | _ |
| Total (urban)† | | | Urban | 10360 | | 34 | 22 | 18 | 3 | 7 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 7 |

CHA indicates congenital heart anomalies; CMP, cardiomyopathy; EMF, endomyocardial fibrosis; HF, heart failure; HTN HD, hypertensive heart disease; IHD, ischemic heart disease; N/A, not available; Peric, pericardial disease; and RHD, rheumatic heart disease.

*Age reported as mean or median.

†Totals are mean percentage weighted by study size.

hypertension were lower in low-income countries than in middle-income countries, and lower in rural than in urban areas.

Age-standardized rates for overweight and obesity are the lowest in the world in South Asia and Central and Eastern sub-Saharan Africa, whereas underweight is most prevalent.⁴⁷ However, there is notably high obesity prevalence in Southern and Western Africa, particularly among women.⁴⁷ Low physical activity is overall least prevalent in sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia in comparison with worldwide estimates.⁴⁸ However, there is regional variation with relatively higher rates of low physical activity in West Africa. Furthermore, people throughout sub-Saharan Africa generally experience heavy occupational physical activity, which may not be as cardioprotective as recreational activity.⁴⁹

Diabetes mellitus currently has low prevalence throughout sub-Saharan Africa, although relatively high prevalence in South Asia; though it is rising in both regions at rates that are higher than what would be expected based on trends in obesity.⁵⁰ Within Malawi, for example, there is no substantial difference in diabetes prevalence with education level.⁵¹ Likewise, cholesterol levels in sub-Saharan Africa are among the lowest in the world, and do not seem to be rising as they have in East Asia.⁵² In South Asia, mean cholesterol has been stable and slightly less than global averages.⁵²

Heavy episodic alcohol consumption is associated with increased IHD, stroke, and atrial fibrillation.⁵³ Episodic drinking is second highest in sub-Saharan Africa and in Latin America and the Caribbean, after Eastern Europe.⁵⁴ Fruit and vegetable intake is another exception, with low consumption in the world's poorest regions.⁵⁵ Availability and cost of a healthy diet may be prohibitive for the poorest populations who consume less healthy processed carbohydrates and lower quality fats, such as palm oil.⁵⁵

Environmental, Infectious, and Early Life Nutritional Risk Factors

The poorest billion are disproportionately exposed to air pollution and infectious risk factors for CVD. Persistent biomass fuel use among the poor is well documented in censuses and demographic and health surveys. Approximately 3 billion people living in low- and middle-income countries are exposed to household air pollution from the use of biomass fuel.⁵⁶ Exposure to small particulate matter, and other components of biomass smoke, as well, are thought to contribute to hypertension.⁵⁷ Biomass smoke exposure may also contribute to right heart failure, potentiating the effect of other endemic causes of pulmonary hypertension including infectious lung diseases.⁵⁸ Women, who perform a majority of the cooking, often in poorly ventilated kitchens, endure the greatest exposure.59 However, a direct link between household air pollution and CVDs has not yet been demonstrated. The associations between higher ambient fineparticle concentration and increased risk of IHD, stroke, and heart failure are more clear.60 Important sources of ambient fineparticle pollution include road dust and vehicle/industrial emissions, residential biomass and coal burning, road dust, and dust blown from deserts. Solid-waste burning was also a significant contributor to pollution in poor neighborhoods in Ghana, but not more wealthy neighborhood.⁶¹ South Asia has some of the highest ambient particulate matter levels worldwide and increasingly many African cities have levels higher than high-income cities.62

Long-term exposure to lead is associated with high blood pressure and clinical CVD. Populations in Central and Southern Africa and South Asia have some of the highest bone lead concentrations in the world.⁶³ Phasing out of leaded fuel and has begun only lately in low- and middle-income countries.⁶³

Infectious risk factors are an underappreciated cause of CVD among the poor. Infectious drivers of CVD include Chagas disease, enteroviruses, schistosomiasis, tuberculosis, streptococcal pharyngitis, human immunodeficiency virus, rubella, and other causes of inflammation.⁶⁴ There is substantial geographic variation in exposure to pathogens related to CVD even among the poor. We discuss the endemic CVDs associated with infectious diseases in more detail in the online-only Data Supplement, but there is a need to better quantify their contribution to the cardiovascular burden.

Fetal and early childhood undernutrition is also related to CVD later in life. Genetically determined short stature is associated with increased risk of CVD death in adulthood.⁶⁵ Early childhood undernourishment has been associated with elevated cholesterol, elevated fasting plasma glucose, and increased IHD risk.⁶⁶ The highest stunting rates in the world are in sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia.⁶⁷

Global Burden of Disease Study

The Global Burden of Disease (GBD) study uses statistical models to estimate worldwide disease burden based on systematic reviews of primary data.⁶⁸ Available data sources, including vital registration and verbal autopsy data, are combined in the GBD study with Bayesian methods to generate estimates of death and disability attributable to CVD.

As a first approximation of the CVD burden among the poorest, we have analyzed GBD 2013 study data by World Bank country income classification. In addition, we have also analyzed GBD data for the 16 countries in which \geq 70% of the population was living in multidimensional poverty (≥33.3% weighted deprivation), and in which \geq 50% were among the poorest billion (\geq 44.4% of weighted deprivations). The 16 poorest countries have a combined population of ≈330000 people, and are all in sub-Saharan Africa (Niger, Ethiopia, South Sudan, Chad, Burkina Faso, Somalia, Sierra Leone, Guinea-Bissau, Guinea, Mali, Burundi, Central African Republic, the Democratic Republic of Congo, Mozambique, Liberia, and Uganda). Subnational disease burden and risk assessment in the GBD study is currently limited to Mexico and China and is not linked to socioeconomic measures. As a result, we were not able to include subnational regions with high poverty prevalence in middle-income countries in our analysis.

We should note here several ways in which we part with some common conventions in analysis of CVD in the GBD study. First, we describe "combined CVDs" to include both GBD categories of "congenital heart anomalies" and "cardiovascular diseases". We also use crude rates, rather than age-standardized rates given the younger age distribution of poorer populations (age-standardized rates are presented in figures in the online-only Data Supplement). We also focus on disability-adjusted life-years (DALYs) rather than on deaths to account for the importance of death at younger ages.

Estimated CVD Burden Among the Poorest in the GBD Study

We find that, although NCDs as a whole are a significant fraction of the disease burden in the poorest countries, CVD alone, and more specifically IHD, is not (Figure 3). We find that NCDs, CVD, and IHD become progressively less important relative to total burden and to each other in lower-income groups. In the poorest 16 countries, CVD (5.5% of DALYs and 3% of deaths) and IHD (1% of DALYs and 3% of deaths) have an overall small contribution to total disease burden. In contrast, in high-income countries, CVD (18% of DALYs and 38% of deaths) and IHD (9% of DALYs and 20% of deaths) have greater contributions where deaths occur at older ages.

Among the poorest 16 countries, the leading causes of combined CVD DALYs are congenital heart anomalies (19.5%), IHD (18.8%), and hemorrhagic stroke (18.3%; Table 2).⁶⁹ However, the leading causes of CVD deaths are estimated to be IHD (26%) and hemorrhagic (23%) and ischemic stroke (19%). The relative prominence of congenital heart anomaly DALY burden in comparison with mortality reflects disease onset at earlier ages. Although still relatively low, the proportion of GBD-estimated IHD deaths as a fraction of total

| | DALY | s per 100 000 | | To | tal Deaths | Deat | hs per 100 000 | |
|---|------|-----------------------------|-------------------|---------|-----------------------------|-------|-----------------------------|--------------------|
| CVD Category | Rate | 95% Uncertainty Interval | % of CVD DALYs | Number | 95% Uncertainty Interval | Rate | 95% Uncertainty Interval | % of CVD Deaths |
| Congenital heart anomalies | 694 | (291–1504) | 19.5 | 28708 | (12185–61888) | 8.2 | (3.5–17.7) | 6.9 |
| Ischemic heart disease | 669 | (523–837) | 18.8 | 101 480 | (79356–127513) | 29.1 | (22.7–36.5) | 24.5 |
| Hemorrhagic stroke | 650 | (476–880) | 18.3 | 89538 | (62453–127470) | 25.6 | (17.9–36.5) | 21.6 |
| Other cardiovascular and circulatory diseases | 448 | (297–700) | 12.6 | 45 449 | (29401–74956) | 13.0 | (8.4–21.5) | 11.0 |
| Ischemic stroke | 382 | (180–537) | 10.8 | 73813 | (34993–102649) | 21.1 | (10.0–29.4) | 17.8 |
| Cardiomyopathy and myocarditis | 223 | (142–313) | 6.3 | 18723 | (12472–26327) | 5.4 | (3.6–7.5) | 4.5 |
| Hypertensive heart disease | 211 | (140–309) | 5.9 | 33 290 | (21 375–51 642) | 9.5 | (6.1–14.8) | 8.0 |
| Rheumatic heart disease | 187 | (134–292) | 5.3 | 13707 | (9174–23753) | 3.9 | (2.6–6.8) | 3.3 |
| Endocarditis | 60.0 | (38.9–87.7) | 1.7 | 5858 | (3976–8606) | 1.7 | (1.1–2.5) | 1.4 |
| Aortic aneurysm | 25.4 | (15.3–39.9) | 0.7 | 3794 | (2341–5954) | 1.1 | (0.7–1.7) | 0.9 |
| Atrial fibrillation and flutter | 5.2 | (3.4–7.4) | 0.15 | 117 | (56–201) | 0.03 | (0.02-0.06) | 0.03 |
| Peripheral vascular disease | 1.6 | (0.9–2.5) | 0.04 | 175 | (108–271) | 0.05 | (0.03–0.08) | 0.04 |
| Combined CVD | 3557 | (2242–5509) | 100 | 414651 | (398 128-447 831) | 118.7 | (114.0–128.2) | 100 |
| Combined CVDs as a proportion of total burden | | | 5.5 | | | | | 12.4 |

Table 2. Estimated Crude DALYs and Deaths From CVD Including Congenital Heart Anomalies in the 16 Poorest Countries With \geq 70% of the Population Living in Multidimensional Poverty, and \geq 44.4 of Weighted Deprivations* Both Sexes, GBD 2013 Study⁶⁹

CVD indicates cardiovascular disease; DALY, disability-adjusted life-year; and GBD, Global Burden of Disease.

*Sixteen poorest countries by multidimensional poverty index (% of population with \geq 44.4% of weighted deprivations): Niger (82%), Ethiopia (79%), South Sudan (82%), Chad (78%), Burkina Faso (71%), Somalia (72%), Sierra Leone (65%), Guinea-Bissau (64%), Guinea (61%), Mali (64%), Burundi (65%), Central African Republic (63%), Democratic Republic of the Congo (63%), Mozambique (57%), Liberia (51%), and Uganda (52%).

CVD deaths (15%) in the poorest countries contrasts with the general absence of IHD as a cause of heart failure in the low-income country CVD registries previously described.

Risk-Factor Attribution for CVD in the GBD Study

The GBD study attributes a select group of underlying risks in 3 overlapping major categories – behavior, metabolic, and

environmental/occupational – to the mortality and morbidity estimates. The behavioral risks that impact CVD are tobacco, alcohol and drug use, low physical activity, and selected dietary risks. The metabolic risks are systolic high blood pressure (\geq 115 mmHg), high body mass index, high fasting plasma glucose, high total cholesterol, and low glomerular filtration rate. The environmental risks that impact CVD are household and ambient



Figure 3. Proportion of crude DALYs from IHD, CVD (including congenital heart anomalies), and NCDs by World Bank income grouping and for the 16 countries with ≥70% of the population living in multidimensional poverty.⁶⁷ CVD indicates cardiovascular disease; DALY, disability-adjusted life-year; IHD, ischemic heart disease; and NCD, noncommunicable disease.

| Risk Factor Category* | Niger† | Poorest 16 Countries | Low Income | Lower Middle Income | Upper Middle Income | High Income | Global |
|---|-----------|-------------------------|------------|------------------------|------------------------|-------------|-----------|
| Congenital heart anomalies | - | 1 | | 1 | | | 1 |
| Behavioral and metabolic risk factors | - | _ | - | - | _ | _ | _ |
| Environmental/occupational risk factors | - | _ | - | - | _ | _ | _ |
| Unattributed | 672 (100) | 694 (100) | 597 (100) | 475 (100) | 310 (100) | 105 (100) | 366 (100) |
| Total | 672 (100) | 694 (100) | 597 (100) | 475 (100) | 310 (100) | 105 (100) | 366 (100) |
| CVDs | | | | | | | |
| Behavioral and metabolic risk factors | 1629 (69) | 2039 (71) | 2849 (79) | 4152 (85) | 3910 (89) | 4439 (87) | 3966 (86) |
| Environmental/occupational risk factors | 728 (31) | 916 (32) | 1283 (36) | 1408 (29) | 1166 (27) | 472 (9) | 1141 (25) |
| Unattributed | 695 (29) | 736 (26) | 661 (18) | 661 (14) | 417 (10) | 623 (12) | 571 (12) |
| Total | 2378 | 2863 | 3609 | 4883 | 4386 | 5094 | 4599 |
| Combined CVD and congenital heart anomalies | | | | | | | ^ |
| Behavioral and metabolic risk factors | 1629 (53) | 2039 (57) | 2849 (68) | 4152 (77) | 3910 (83) | 4439 (85) | 3966 (80) |
| Environmental/occupational risk factors | 728 (24) | 916 (26) | 1283 (30) | 1408 (26) | 1166 (25) | 472 (9) | 1141 (23) |
| Unattributed | 1367 (45) | 1430 (40) | 1258 (30) | 1137 (21) | 727 (15) | 728 (14) | 937 (19) |
| Total | 3049 | 3557 | 4206 | 5358 | 4696 | 5199 | 4965 |

| Table 3. | Crude DALYs per 100 (| 000 Population (%) by F | isk Factor Categor | y and Country Income | e Grouping, GBD Study 2013 |
|----------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|
|----------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|

CVD indicates cardiovascular disease; and DALY, disability-adjusted life-year.

*The behavioral and metabolic category includes any overlap with environmental/occupational. The environmental/occupational category includes any overlap with behavioral and metabolic. Because of multicausality and the resulting overlap, the sum of the DALY rates in a given column will be greater than the total and greater than 100%.

†Niger is the country with the largest proportion of its population (82%) within the world's poorest billion people.

air pollution and lead exposure. No early childhood risk factor for CVDs is quantified. The burden not attributed to any modeled risk factor is also reported.

To better understand the disease burden attributable to traditional CVD risks factors, we analyzed the proportion of CVD DALYs that are explained by (1) behavioral and metabolic risk factors; (2) environmental risk factors; and (3) burden not attributed to any modeled risk for each of the country groups described above (Figure 4, Table 3).⁶⁹ Our presentation accounts for multicausality within the disease burden. For example, high sodium intake (a behavioral risk factor) and lead exposure (an environmental risk factor) both contribute to the hypertensive heart disease burden, with all or some of their burden mediated by high blood pressure. We describe the proportion of the burden attributable to both of behavioral/ metabolic and environmental risk factors as an overlap. The



Figure 4. The proportion of crude DALYs attributable to risk-factor categories for CVD (excluding congenital heart anomalies; **Left**) and combined CVD and congenital heart anomalies by World Bank income category, the GBD study (**Right**). The risk factor categories include environmental/occupational, and unattributed risk factors (green), behavior and metabolic risk factors excluding overlap with environmental/occupational (orange) environmental/occupational excluding overlap with behavior and metabolic (blue), both environmental/occupational and behavioral/metabolic (orange and blue stripe), and unattributed risk factors (grey). All congenital heart anomaly DALYs are unattributed to any quantified risk.



Figure 5. Crude DALYs per 100000 population attributable to risk factor categories for congenital heart anomalies (Left), CVD (as defined in the GBD study; Center), and combined CVD including congenital heart anomalies by World Bank income category, the GBD study (Right). The risk factor categories include behavior and metabolic risk factors excluding overlap with environmental/occupational (orange) environmental/occupational excluding overlap with behavior and metabolic (blue), both environmental/occupational and behavioral/ metabolic (orange and blue stripe), and unattributed risk factors (grey).

behavioral/metabolic category includes the overlap between the individual component risk categories.

We found that the fraction of CVD risk attributable to behavioral and metabolic risks was inversely related to income level. For the poorest countries, the proportion of CVD DALYs attributable to selected behavior/metabolic risk factors (including the overlap with environmental risk factors) was 71%; it declined to 57% when congenital heart anomalies - which are unattributed to any of the quantified risks - was included. With increasing income, the proportion of behavioral and metabolic risk factors rises to 87% for CVDs in high-income countries, and 85% when congenital heart anomalies are included. Twenty-three percent of the burden is estimated to be attributable to overlapping risks in the poorest countries. For the poorest billion, the burden due to behavioral and metabolic risk factors may be as low as 53%, as it is in Niger. The high burden of congenital heart anomalies for the poorest populations stems from greater exposure to infectious risk factors and lack of access to surgical care.⁷⁰ With access to appropriate medical and surgical care in developed countries, more than 90% of patient with congenital heart anomalies survive to adulthood.71

In addition, we analyzed the crude DALY rates and their risk factor attribution for (1) congenital heart anomalies, (2) CVD, and (3) combined CVD including congenital heart anomalies (Figure 5, Table 3). We found that congenital heart anomalies DALY rates (unattributed to any modeled risk factor) are much higher in the poorest 16 countries (694 DALYs per 100000) compared with high-income countries (105 DALYs per 100000). The burden of CVDs is lower in the poorest 16 countries (2863 DALYs per 100000) compared with high-income countries (5094 DALYs per 100000). The rate of combined CVDs including congenital heart anomalies is lower in the poorest 16 countries (3557 DALYs per 100000) than high-income countries (5199 DALYs per 100000). For CVDs (excluding congenital heart anomalies), the crude burden attributable to behavioral and metabolic risk factors rises from 2039 DALYs per 100000 (poorest countries) to 4439 DALYs per 100000 (high-income countries). When including congenital heart anomalies within combined CVDs, the burden attributable to behavioral and metabolic risk factors is much lower in the poorest countries (2039 per

100 000) than in high-income countries (4439 per 100 000). Conversely, DALY rates not ue to behavior or metabolic risks (unattributed burden and the portion of environmental burden which does not overlap behavior/metabolic) is higher in the poorest 16 countries (1518 DALYs per 100 000) than in highincome countries (760 DALYs per 100 000).

The crude burden reported is particularly relevant for establishing priorities within countries with a large proportion of the poor. Age-standardized estimates account for varying age distributions between countries and show there remains a gradient of inequity across countries by income category, though the magnitude is attenuated (Figures I and II and Table V in the online-only Data Supplement). For CVDs, behavior and metabolic risk factors account for 80% of the burden in the poorest countries and 87% in high-income countries. For combined CVDs including congenital heart anomalies, behavior and metabolic risk factors account for 75% of DALYs in the poorest countries and 84% in high-income countries.

Finally, we analyzed the crude DALY rate for CVD attributed to high systolic blood pressure (Figure 6). We found that,



Figure 6. DALYs per 100 000 population attributable to systolic blood pressure (SBP) ≥115 mm Hg by World Bank income category, all ages, the GBD study. DALY indicates disability-adjusted life-year; and GBD, Global Burden of Disease.

because of the older age structure of high-income populations, the crude DALY rate for high blood pressure increases with increasing income. At the same time, high systolic blood pressure accounts for 42% of the combined CVD (including congenital heart anomalies) DALY rate (1500/3557 DALYs per 100 000) in the poorest countries, versus 53% (2776/5199 DALYs per 100 000) in high-income countries.

Challenges in Describing the CVD Burden of the Poorest

As we have discussed, facility-based cardiovascular registries appear to suggest lower burden of IHD in low-income countries than those estimated in the GBD study. Here we speculate why the GBD study may tend to overestimate the importance of IHD among the poor relative to other causes of cardiovascular mortality such as RHD.

For its cause of death and mortality estimates, GBD relies on vital registration systems and verbal autopsy studies. Vital registration data come primarily from high- and middle-income countries. In sub-Saharan Africa, for example, <5% of deaths, mostly concentrated in urban areas, are recorded.⁷² In fact, the entire region of central sub-Saharan Africa has no vital registration or verbal autopsy data. Only a handful of sub-Saharan African countries contributed cause of death data to the GBD 2013 study: verbal autopsy data are available from Burkina Faso, Ethiopia, Mozambique, South Africa, and Tanzania; vital registration sources include Mauritius, Seychelles, and South Africa, with limited data from Mali, Mozambique, and Zimbabwe.73 Where data are lacking, cause-of-death assignments are modeled starting with data from neighboring countries and adjusted for country-level covariates such as education, income, and blood pressure levels. Data inputs such as other risk factor prevalence and health facility registries are difficult to incorporate into the GBD modeled cause-of-death estimates. Furthermore, heart failure is not considered an underlying cause of death or disability in the International Classification of Diseases system.⁷⁴ Thus, the apparent heart failure burden is distributed among the underlying root CVD causes.74 For sub-Saharan Africa, heart failure is attributed to hypertension ($\approx 30\%$), cardiomyopathy ($\approx 25\%$), valvular disease ($\approx 15\%$), and IHD ($\approx 5\%$).²⁶ Although the resultant modeled estimates for sub-Saharan Africa have wide uncertainty, they likely represent the best available population-based regional estimates.

Angina is the main source of IHD disability apart from heart failure. The Rose angina questionnaire is the most commonly used survey tool to assess angina. However, the questionnaire overestimates angina prevalence in settings where IHD is uncommon.⁷⁴

The Endemic CVDs of Poverty

The findings from both the primary data and our analysis of the GBD study are consistent with a CVD distribution among the poor that is substantially less dominated by IHD and includes a broader range of conditions associated with infectious, environmental, and as-yet-unquantified early childhood risk factors.⁷⁵ Summarized in Table 4, they principally include hemorrhagic and ischemic stroke and heart failure from various causes, including hypertensive heart disease, nonischemic cardiomyopathies, rheumatic heart disease, congenital heart anomalies, right heart failure, and endomyocardial fibrosis. Further discussion can be found in the online-only Data Supplement.

The pattern of behavioral risks among the poor is distinct compared to more affluent populations. Generally, the poorest billion people lack the choice to live in healthier environments, access basic health systems, or to choose healthy foods and behaviors.^{55,86} Despite the fact that the largest number of people living under multidimensional poverty are in Africa and South Asia, a distinct pattern of CVD risk factors is present in rural areas of Latin America.⁸⁷ For example, in rural Peru, 76% of people in a community-based sample did not have any of the 6 most common CVD risk factors.⁸⁷ Our summary supports a predominance of cardiovascular conditions that have long been endemic among the poorest populations.⁸⁸

Appropriate Targets and Interventions for CVD Control Among the Poorest

The 9 targets of the global monitoring framework for NCD control have focused on the reduction of behavioral risks (salt, tobacco, alcohol, physical inactivity) and metabolic risks (high blood pressure, diabetes mellitus, and obesity), and on multidrug therapy for treatment of individuals at high risk of heart attack and stroke based on these risks.⁸⁹ Achieving the behavioral and metabolic risk targets is expected to contribute toward a 25% mortality reduction between the ages of 30 and 70 years for CVD, cancer, diabetes mellitus, and chronic lung disease by 2025. Several studies have modeled the 10-year effects of achieving the risk factor targets on age 30 to 70 year cardiovascular mortality in different regions of the world.^{80,81} There is regional variation in the degree of CVD mortality reduction. Kontis et al⁹⁰ evaluated sub-Saharan Africa as a macro-region and found that achieving the risk-factor targets will contribute to but not achieve a 25% reduction in CVD by 2025, largely because some of the leading causes of premature NCD mortality, like cervical cancer and RHD, have no or limited association with the targets. Roth et al,⁹¹ using GBD study data, projected that the goal will be achieved in Eastern and Southern sub-Saharan Africa, but not in the more impoverished Central or Western sub-Saharan Africa regions. Both studies suggest achieving the targets would result in large reductions of CVD deaths.90,91 Lowering blood pressure is the main driver of overall CVD improvements, while the other behavioral and metabolic risk factors had much smaller contributions.90,91

Although we agree that the current global targets for NCD and CVD control will result in reductions in CVD burden, the results above indicate that the global targets are insufficient for the world's poorest populations because of the differences in CVD epidemiology. Specifically for CVD, the greatest deficiencies of the global target are the exclusion of deaths from congenital heart anomalies and deaths at <30 years of age from the analytic frame, and the absence of focus on infectious causes of CVDs.

In the poorest countries, up to 75% of the population is <30 years of age, whereas in high-income countries \approx 70% of the population is >30 years of age.³⁷ Furthermore, many of the CVDs associated with risk factors of material poverty, such as rheumatic heart disease and some cardiomyopathies, strike at young ages. Finally, congenital heart anomalies go virtually

Table 4. Endemic CVDs of the Poor and Risk Factors

| CVD Type | Poverty-Related Risk Factors for Premature Death (Including Lack of Awareness and Treatment of Underlying Conditions) | Estimated Burden | Source |
|----------------------------|---|--|---|
| Hemorrhagic stroke | High blood pressure | 905 DALYs/100 000 people in low-income countries | GBD 201369 |
| | Low fruit and vegetable intake | | |
| lschemic stroke | High blood pressure | 521 DALYs/100 000 people in low-income countries | GBD 201369 |
| | Cardioembolic causes: RHD, endocarditis, peripartum cardiomyopathy | | |
| | HIV | | |
| | Hemoglobinopathies | | |
| Hypertensive heart disease | High blood pressure | 255 DALYs/100 000 people in low-income countries | GBD 201369 |
| Cardiomyopathies | Chagas disease | 175 DALYs/100 000 people in low-income countries | GBD 201369 |
| | HIV | | |
| | Other viruses | | |
| | Severe anemia | | |
| | Micronutrient deficiencies | | |
| Peripartum cardiomyopathy | Multiple gestation | 1 in 300 live births (Haiti) | Single-center case series ⁷⁶ |
| | Malnutrition | 1 in 1000 (South Africa) | |
| | Lack of access to birth control | 1 in 1000–4000 (United States) | |
| Chagas disease | Trypanosoma cruzi | 37 000 cases/y | 77–79 |
| | Living in homes with mud walls or thatched roofs | | |
| | Lack of parasite control | | |
| | Lack of medical insurance | | |
| | Low education | | |
| | Overcrowding | | |
| Rheumatic heart disease | Recurrent group A streptococcal pharyngitis | 183 DALYs/100 000 people in low-income countries | GBD 2013 ^{69,80} |
| | Crowded housing | Prevalence may be 36 million | |
| | Lack of access to penicillin | | |
| Pericardial disease | Tuberculosis | $\approx\!7\%$ of all TB cases: 700 000 people worldwide. | |
| Congenital heart anomalies | Maternal rubella | 8–9/1000 live births | 70, 81, 82 |
| | Maternal diabetes mellitus | ≈190 000 deaths/y | |
| | Micronutrient deficiencies (folate) | | |
| | Herbicides and pesticides | | |
| Right heart failure | Acute respiratory infections | 20–25 million | 83 |
| | Ambient air pollution | | |
| | Tuberculosis | | |
| | Schistosomiasis | | |
| Endomyocardial fibrosis | Unknown | Not well estimated, but sporadically significant in, eg, southern Uganda, parts of Mozambique | 84,85 |

CVD indicates cardiovascular disease; DALY, disability-adjusted life-year; GBD Global Burden of Disease; HIV, Human immunodeficiency virus; and RHD, rheumatic heart disease.

untreated in the poorest populations in comparison with highincome populations. Consequently, about 34% of DALYs due to CVD (including congenital heart anomalies) are accrued before of 30 years of age in the poorest 16 countries (Table VII of the online-only data supplement). Meanwhile, only 3% of combined CVD DALYs (including congenital heart anomalies) are accrued before 30 years of age in high-income countries.

The limited framing of the global NCD and CVD mortality reduction target has been accompanied by a similarly

| Table 5. | Gaps/Challenges | and Future | Directions for | Research and Policy |
|----------|------------------------|------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|
| | | | | |

| Potential Solution/Future Direction |
|---|
| |
| Data sources must include people from all socioeconomic strata and all regions within a country, particularly rural. |
| Include further subnational estimates within the Global Burden of Disease Study |
| Encourage low-cost vital registration techniques that include cause of death determination. |
| Expand the Data for Health initiative to support LMICs to integrate mobile technologies in strengthening vital registration systems. |
| Further validation studies of verbal autopsy specifically assessing heart failure accuracy. |
| Expand availability or portable and handheld echocardiography using task shifting/sharing and telemedicine. |
| Reclassify heart failure as a cause of morbidity and mortality to better estimate its public health importance. |
| |
| Integrate assessment of socioeconomic status or wealth into vital registration and disease surveillance systems. |
| Use simplified asset indices for many LMICs derived from existing Demographic and Health Survey data, which are easy to use, have good agreement, and are freely available at www.equitytool.org. |
| Use multidimensional poverty assessments to more accurately describe the simultaneous deprivations of the poor. |
| |
| Expand the age ranges for premature CVD reduction goals to include people ${<}30~\mbox{y}.$ |
| Express a CVD mortality in terms of reducing the rate of years of life lost. Mortality targets could explicitly include deaths at young ages, such as <40 y. |
| Include additional targets promoting the strengthening of integrated health systems and environmental and infectious risk factors, which are more pertinent to endemic CVDs. |
| Expand multidrug therapy targets to include heart failure, in addition to stroke and ischemic heart disease. |
| |
| Multisector approach to addressing health, education, finance, labor, infrastructure, and agriculture for primordial prevention. |
| Equity audits of interventions to ensure the most vulnerable people will realize the benefit. |
| Improve fetal and early childhood nutrition. |
| Further research using extended cost-effectiveness analysis of interventions evaluating additional outcomes such as poverty alleviation. |
| Decentralized health systems including primary care clinics and community- based care need strengthening. |
| Aspire toward universal health coverage to support financial risk protection. |
| Further research evaluating the effectiveness of task shifting/sharing and community health workers for endemic CVD prevention and management. |
| Incorporate endemic CVD care training into local medical and nursing schools and postgraduate programs |
| Development of locally endorsed and contextually appropriate evidence-based protocols. |
| |

CVD indicates cardiovascular disease; GBD Global Burden of Disease LMIC, low- and middle-income countries; and UN, United Nations.

Downloaded from http://circ.ahajournals.org/ by guest on July 29, 2016

limited focus on behavioral and metabolic risk factors and their associated diseases. In addition, the 2 health system targets primarily also address metabolic risks: (1) available and affordable medicines for NCDs, and (2) preventive medicines for people at high risk of heart attack and stroke. Our analysis of GBD study data including death and disability at <30 years of age (eg, attributable to congenital heart anomalies and RHD), and focusing on DALYs rather than deaths, suggests that there is a significant opportunity to reduce the CVD burden in the poorest populations through a broader set of interventions; this analysis is summarized in Table 5. These finding are also supported by our review of primary data.

A CVD mortality target appropriate for the world's poorest could be expressed in terms of reductions in the crude rate of years of life lost as suggested recently in the context of the Sustainable Development Goals.⁹² Or alternatively, mortality targets could explicitly prioritize deaths at younger ages, as affirmed by NCD divisions in several Eastern and Southern African countries calling for an 80% reduction in mortality from NCDs and injuries before 40 years of age.⁹³ The World Heart Federation has also endorsed a goal of reducing cardiovascular mortality <25 years of age in the context of its rheumatic heart disease control strategy.⁹⁴

Strategies to achieve such broader mortality targets in the poorest populations would likely include attention to environmental risks, and broader healthcare interventions to address structural heart disease, as well.95,96 Critical healthcare interventions include cardiac surgery at referral centers for congenital heart anomalies and advanced RHD.97 In addition, integrated delivery models are needed to decentralize initial echocardiographic diagnosis and management of heart failure and RHD (including anticoagulation) to district hospitals.^{12,98,99} Health centers need to be equipped to both identify and manage suspected streptococcal pharyngitis, rheumatic fever, hypertension, and stable RHD as part of primary care.¹⁰⁰⁻¹⁰² Community health workers need to be equipped to both offer adherence support and refer sick individuals to higher levels when necessary. Interventions to address mental health among those with established cardiac disease need to be introduced as part of a process of chronic care integration and decentralization.103

The World Health Organization's 2011 investment case to achieve global targets for NCD control called for \approx US\$11.4 billion per year.¹⁰⁴ Approximately 75% of the investment was directed toward multidrug therapy for individuals at high CVD risk. Ninety-five percent of proposed funds were directed toward middle-income countries.

To rebalance and reinvigorate the global conversation on NCDs in the interest of those living in extreme poverty, *The Lancet* has convened a Commission on "Reframing NCDs and Injuries for the Poorest Billion."¹⁰⁵ The Commission will provide the analytic basis for integrated country-level investment prioritizing the specific needs of the world's poorest people. The Commission's report in 2017 will catalyze progress toward global health equity and poverty eradication. This publication is part of a contribution to that effort.

Conclusion

The poorest billion people are spread throughout the world. Estimating the CVD epidemiology of the poor is challenging – primarily due to the urban bias of data on CVD mortality and morbidity. Despite limitations, CVD registries from the poorest countries have consistently shown a low prevalence IHD and predominance of other endemic CVDs. Analysis of data from the GBD Study shows that metabolic and behavioral risk factors only contribute to about 53% of the combined CVD (including congenital heart anomalies) burden in the poorest country. Thus, current global NCD and CVD disease control targets will likely help reduce the premature CVD burden, but are not sufficient. Expanded targets focusing on infectious and environmental risks, as well integrated health system interventions that address CVD in people < 30 years of age due to RHD and congenital heart anomalies are needed.

Acknowledgments

We thank Kafui Adjaye-Gbewonyo, PhD, for her integral assistance in data analysis. This work was supported by The Leona M and Harry B Helmsley Charitable Trust. The analysis included in this manuscript is that of the authors alone and does not necessarily reflect the views of the Helmsley Charitable Trust. All references and conclusions are intended for educational and informative purposes and do not constitute an endorsement or recommendation from the Helmsley Charitable Trust.

Disclosures

None.

References

- World Health Organization. Sixty-Fifth World Health Assembly Resolutions, Decisions, Annexes. WHA65/2012/REC/1 [Internet]. 2012. http://apps.who.int/gb/or/e/e_wha65r1.html. Accessed May 1, 2016.
- World Heart Federation. 25 by 25 [Internet]. http://www.world-heartfederation.org/what-we-do/advocacy/25-by-25/ Cited February 1, 2014. Accessed May 1, 2016.
- Yusuf S, Reddy S, Ounpuu S, Anand S. Global burden of cardiovascular diseases: part I: general considerations, the epidemiologic transition, risk factors, and impact of urbanization. *Circulation*. 2001;104:2746–2753.
- The World Bank. Global Monitoring Report 2015/2016: Development Goals in an Era of Demographic Change. Washington, DC: The World Bank; 2015.
- Alkire S, Roche JM, Seth S. Identifying the "Bottom Billion": Beyond National Averages. Oxford, United Kingdom: Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative; 2013.
- Alkire S, Santos ME. A multidimensional approach: poverty measurement & beyond. Soc Indic Res. 2013;112:239–257.
- Wang X, Feng H, Xia Q, Alkire S. On the relationship between income poverty and multidimensional poverty in China. *OPHI Working Paper* 101. Oxford, United Kingdom: Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative; 2016.
- Alkire S, Robles G. Multidimensional poverty index 2015: brief methodological note and results. Oxford, United Kingdom: Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative; 2015.
- He J, Ogden LG, Bazzano LA, Vupputuri S, Loria C, Whelton PK. Risk factors for congestive heart failure in US men and women: NHANES I epidemiologic follow-up study. *Arch Intern Med.* 2001;161:996–1002.
- Tantchou Tchoumi JC, Ambassa JC, Kingue S, Giamberti A, Cirri S, Frigiola A, Butera G. Occurrence, aetiology and challenges in the management of congestive heart failure in sub-Saharan Africa: experience of the Cardiac Centre in Shisong, Cameroon. *Pan Afr Med J.* 2011;8:11.
- Kwan GF, Jean-Baptiste W, Cleophat P, Leandre F, Louine M, Luma M, Benjamin EJ, Mukherjee JS, Bukhman G, Hirschhorn LR. Descriptive epidemiology and short-term outcomes of heart failure hospitalisation in rural Haiti. *Heart*. 2016;102:140–146. doi: 10.1136/heartjnl-2015-308451.
- 12. Kwan GF, Bukhman AK, Miller AC, Ngoga G, Mucumbitsi J, Bavuma C, Dusabeyezu S, Rich ML, Mutabazi F, Mutumbira C, Ngiruwera JP, Amoroso C, Ball E, Fraser HS, Hirschhorn LR, Farmer P, Rusingiza E, Bukhman G. A simplified echocardiographic strategy for heart failure diagnosis and management within an integrated noncommunicable disease

clinic at district hospital level for sub-Saharan Africa. *JACC. Heart Fail.* 2013;1:230–236. doi: 10.1016/j.jchf.2013.03.006.

- Jingi AM, Noubiap JJ, Kamdem P, Wawo Yonta E, Temfack E, Kouam Kouam C, Kingue S. The spectrum of cardiac disease in the West Region of Cameroon: a hospital-based cross-sectional study. *Int Arch Med.* 2013;6:44. doi: 10.1186/1755-7682-6-44.
- 14. Damasceno A, Mayosi BM, Sani M, Ogah OS, Mondo C, Ojji D, Dzudie A, Kouam CK, Suliman A, Schrueder N, Yonga G, Ba SA, Maru F, Alemayehu B, Edwards C, Davison BA, Cotter G, Sliwa K. The causes, treatment, and outcome of acute heart failure in 1006 Africans from 9 countries. *Arch Intern Med.* 2012;172:1386–1394. doi: 10.1001/archinternmed.2012.3310.
- Kingue S, Dzudie A, Menanga A, Akono M, Ouankou M, Muna W. [A new look at adult chronic heart failure in Africa in the age of the Doppler echocardiography: experience of the medicine department at Yaounde General Hospital]. *Ann Cardiol Angeiol (Paris)*. 2005;54:276–283. doi: 10.1016/j.ancard.2005.04.014.
- Amoah AG, Kallen C. Aetiology of heart failure as seen from a National Cardiac Referral Centre in Africa. *Cardiology*. 2000;93:11–18. doi: 6996.
- Bloomfield GS, DeLong AK, Akwanalo CO, Hogan JW, Carter EJ, Aswa DF, Binanay C, Koech M, Kimaiyo S, Velazquez EJ. Markers of atherosclerosis, clinical characteristics, and treatment patterns in heart failure: a case-control study of middle-aged adult heart failure patients in rural Kenya. *Glob Heart*. 2016;11:97–107. doi: 10.1016/j.gheart.2015.12.014.
- Oyoo GO, Ogola EN. Clinical and socio demographic aspects of congestive heart failure patients at Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi. *East Afr Med J.* 1999;76:23–27.
- Soliman EZ, Juma H. Cardiac disease patterns in northern Malawi: epidemiologic transition perspective. J Epidemiol. 2008;18:204–208.
- Ojji DB, Alfa J, Ajayi SO, Mamven MH, Falase AO. Pattern of heart failure in Abuja, Nigeria: an echocardiographic study. *Cardiovasc J Afr.* 2009;20:349–352.
- 21. Ojji D, Stewart S, Ajayi S, Manmak M, Sliwa K. A predominance of hypertensive heart failure in the Abuja Heart Study cohort of urban Nigerians: a prospective clinical registry of 1515 de novo cases. *Eur J Heart Fail*. 2013;15:835–842. doi: 10.1093/eurjhf/hft061.
- Onwuchekwa AC, Asekomeh GE. Pattern of heart failure in a Nigerian teaching hospital. Vasc Health Risk Manag. 2009;5:745–750.
- Ansa VO, Ekott JU, Essien IO, Bassey EO. Seasonal variation in admission for heart failure, hypertension and stroke in Uyo, South-Eastern Nigeria. Ann Afr Med. 2008;7:62–66.
- Thiam M. [Cardiac insufficiency in the African cardiology milieu]. Bull Soc Pathol Exot. 2003;96:217–218.
- Stewart S, Wilkinson D, Hansen C, Vaghela V, Mvungi R, McMurray J, Sliwa K. Predominance of heart failure in the Heart of Soweto Study cohort: emerging challenges for urban African communities. *Circulation*. 2008;118:2360–2367. doi: 10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.108.786244.
- 26. Makubi A, Hage C, Lwakatare J, Kisenge P, Makani J, Rydén L, Lund LH. Contemporary aetiology, clinical characteristics and prognosis of adults with heart failure observed in a tertiary hospital in Tanzania: the prospective Tanzania Heart Failure (TaHeF) study. *Heart*. 2014;100:1235–1241. doi: 10.1136/heartjnl-2014-305599.
- Freers J, Mayanja-Kizza H, Ziegler JL, Rutakingirwa M. Echocardiographic diagnosis of heart disease in Uganda. *Trop Doct*. 1996;26:125–128.
- Khatibzadeh S, Farzadfar F, Oliver J, Ezzati M, Moran A. Worldwide risk factors for heart failure: a systematic review and pooled analysis. *Int J Cardiol.* 2013;168:1186–1194. doi: 10.1016/j.ijcard.2012.11.065.
- Dgedge M, Novoa A, Macassa G, Sacarlal J, Black J, Michaud C, Cliff J. The burden of disease in Maputo City, Mozambique: registered and autopsied deaths in 1994. *Bull World Health Organ.* 2001;79:546–552.
- Steenekamp JH, Simson IW, Theron W. Cardiovascular causes of death at Tshepong Hospital in 1 year, 1989-1990. A necropsy study. S Afr Med J. 1992;81:142–146.
- Bertrand E, Muna WF, Diouf SM, Ekra A, Kane A, Kingue S, Kombila P, Mbaissoroum M, Niakara A, Ould Eba A, Sidi Al AO, Yapobi Y; Group Urgences Cardiovascularires en Afrique Subsaharienne. [Cardiovascular emergencies in Subsaharan Africa]. Arch Mal Coeur Vaiss. 2006;99:1159–1165.
- 32. Ogeng'o JA, Gatonga P, Olabu BO. Cardiovascular causes of death in an east African country: an autopsy study. *Cardiol J.* 2011;18:67–72.
- World Health Organization. Verbal autopsy standards: the 2014 WHO verbal autopsy instrument. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2015.
- Lozano R, Freeman MK, James SL, Campbell B, Lopez AD, Flaxman AD, Murray CJ; Population Health Metrics Research Consortium (PHMRC). Performance of InterVA for assigning causes of death to verbal autopsies:

multisite validation study using clinical diagnostic gold standards. *Popul Health Metr.* 2011;9:50. doi: 10.1186/1478-7954-9-50.

- Lozano R, Lopez AD, Atkinson C, Naghavi M, Flaxman AD, Murray CJ; Population Health Metrics Research Consortium (PHMRC). Performance of physician-certified verbal autopsies: multisite validation study using clinical diagnostic gold standards. *Popul Health Metr.* 2011;9:32. doi: 10.1186/1478-7954-9-32.
- 36. Streatfield PK, Khan WA, Bhuiya A, Hanifi SM, Alam N, Bagagnan CH, Sié A, Zabré P, Lankoandé B, Rossier C, Soura AB, Bonfoh B, Kone S, Ngoran EK, Utzinger J, Haile F, Melaku YA, Weldearegawi B, Gomez P, Jasseh M, Ansah P, Debpuur C, Oduro A, Wak G, Adjei A, Gyapong M, Sarpong D, Kant S, Misra P, Rai SK, Juvekar S, Lele P, Bauni E, Mochamah G, Ndila C, Williams TN, Laserson KF, Nyaguara A, Odhiambo FO, Phillips-Howard P, Ezeh A, Kyobutungi C, Oti S, Crampin A, Nyirenda M, Price A, Delaunay V, Diallo A, Douillot L, Sokhna C, Gómez-Olivé FX, Kahn K, Tollman SM, Herbst K, Mossong J, Chuc NT, Bangha M, Sankoh OA, Byass P. Adult non-communicable disease mortality in Africa and Asia: evidence from INDEPTH Health and Demographic Surveillance System sites. *Glob Health Action*. 2014;7:25365.
- United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division. World Population Prospects: The 2012 Revision, DVD Edition. 2013.
- 38. Hajifathalian K, Ueda P, Lu Y, Woodward M, Ahmadvand A, Aguilar-Salinas CA, Azizi F, Cifkova R, Di Cesare M, Eriksen L, Farzadfar F, Ikeda N, Khalili D, Khang YH, Lanska V, León-Muñoz L, Magliano D, Msyamboza KP, Oh K, Rodríguez-Artalejo F, Rojas-Martinez R, Shaw JE, Stevens GA, Tolstrup J, Zhou B, Salomon JA, Ezzati M, Danaei G. A novel risk score to predict cardiovascular disease risk in national populations (Globorisk): a pooled analysis of prospective cohorts and health examination surveys. *Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol.* 2015;3:339–355. doi: 10.1016/S2213-8587(15)00081-9.
- Hirai M, Grover N, Huang C. The measurement of non-communicable diseases in 25 countries with demographic and health surveys. DHS Occasional Papers No. 10. Rockville, MD: ICF International; 2015.
- World Health Organization. STEPS Country Reports [Internet]. http:// www.who.int/chp/steps/reports/en/ Cited July 22, 2014. Accessed May 1, 2016.
- Palipudi KM, Gupta PC, Sinha DN, Andes LJ, Asma S, McAfee T; GATS Collaborative Group. Social determinants of health and tobacco use in thirteen low and middle income countries: evidence from Global Adult Tobacco Survey. *PLoS One*. 2012;7:e33466. doi: 10.1371/journal. pone.0033466.
- Pampel F. Tobacco use in sub-Sahara Africa: estimates from the demographic health surveys. *Soc Sci Med.* 2008;66:1772–1783. doi: 10.1016/j. socscimed.2007.12.003.
- Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India. Global Adult Tobacco Survey India 2009-2010 [Internet]. Mumbai, India: 2010. http://mohfw.nic.in/WriteReadData/1892s/1455618937GATS India.pdf. Accessed May 31, 2016.
- Li Q, Hsia J, Yang G. Prevalence of smoking in China in 2010. N Engl J Med. 2011;364:2469–2470.
- 45. Danaei G, Finucane MM, Lin JK, Singh GM, Paciorek CJ, Cowan MJ, Farzadfar F, Stevens GA, Lim SS, Riley LM, Ezzati M; Global Burden of Metabolic Risk Factors of Chronic Diseases Collaborating Group (Blood Pressure). National, regional, and global trends in systolic blood pressure since 1980: systematic analysis of health examination surveys and epidemiological studies with 786 country-years and 5.4 million participants. *Lancet.* 2011;377:568–577. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(10)62036-3.
- 46. Chow CK, Teo KK, Rangarajan S, Islam S, Gupta R, Avezum A, Bahonar A, Chifamba J, Dagenais G, Diaz R, Kazmi K, Lanas F, Wei L, Lopez-Jaramillo P, Fanghong L, Ismail NH, Puoane T, Rosengren A, Szuba A, Temizhan A, Wielgosz A, Yusuf R, Yusufali A, McKee M, Liu L, Mony P, Yusuf S; PURE (Prospective Urban Rural Epidemiology) Study investigators. Prevalence, awareness, treatment, and control of hypertension in rural and urban communities in high-, middle-, and low-income countries. *JAMA*. 2013;310:959–968. doi: 10.1001/jama.2013.184182.
- NCD Risk Factor Collaboration. Trends in adult body-mass index in 200 countries from 1975 to 2014: a pooled analysis of 1698 population-based measurement studies with 19-2 million participants. *Lancet*. 2016;387:1377–1396.
- Hallal PC, Andersen LB, Bull FC, Guthold R, Haskell W, Ekelund U; Lancet Physical Activity Series Working Group. Global physical activity levels: surveillance progress, pitfalls, and prospects. *Lancet*. 2012;380:247–257. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(12)60646-1.
- 49. Clays E, Lidegaard M, De Bacquer D, Van Herck K, De Backer G, Kittel F, de Smet P, Holtermann A. The combined relationship of occupational

and leisure-time physical activity with all-cause mortality among men, accounting for physical fitness. *Am J Epidemiol*. 2014;179:559–566. doi: 10.1093/aje/kwt294.

- NCD Risk Factor Collaboration (NCD-RisC). Worldwide trends in diabetes since 1980: a pooled analysis of 751 population-based studies with 4-4 million participants. *Lancet*. 2016;387:1513–1530.
- Di Cesare M, Khang YH, Asaria P, Blakely T, Cowan MJ, Farzadfar F, Guerrero R, Ikeda N, Kyobutungi C, Msyamboza KP, Oum S, Lynch JW, Marmot MG, Ezzati M; Lancet NCD Action Group. Inequalities in noncommunicable diseases and effective responses. *Lancet*. 2013;381:585– 597. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(12)61851-0.
- 52. Farzadfar F, Finucane MM, Danaei G, Pelizzari PM, Cowan MJ, Paciorek CJ, Singh GM, Lin JK, Stevens GA, Riley LM, Ezzati M; Global Burden of Metabolic Risk Factors of Chronic Diseases Collaborating Group (Cholesterol). National, regional, and global trends in serum total cholesterol since 1980: systematic analysis of health examination surveys and epidemiological studies with 321 country-years and 3-0 million participants. *Lancet.* 2011;377:578–586. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(10)62038-7.
- Shield KD, Parry C, Rehm J. Chronic diseases and conditions related to alcohol use. *Alcohol Res.* 2013;35:155–173.
- World Health Organization. Global Status Report on Alcohol and Health 2014. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2014.
- Subramanian SV, Corsi DJ, Subramanyam MA, Smith GD. Jumping the gun: the problematic discourse on socioeconomic status and cardiovascular health in India. *Int J Epidemiol*. 2013;42:1410–1426. doi: 10.1093/ije/ dyt017.
- World Health Organization. Household air pollution and health. Fact Sheet number 292 [Internet]. http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/ fs292/en/. Accessed March 1, 2016.
- Chockalingam A, Tolunay HE, Prabhakaran D, Narula J. Household air pollution: an emerging risk factor for CVD. *Glob Heart*. 2012;7:197–199. doi: 10.1016/j.ghcart.2012.06.013.
- Bloomfield GS, Lagat DK, Akwanalo OC, Carter EJ, Lugogo N, Vedanthan R, Velazquez EJ, Kimaiyo S, Sherman CB. Waiting to inhale: an exploratory review of conditions that may predispose to pulmonary hypertension and right heart failure in persons exposed to household air pollution in low- and middle-income countries. *Glob Heart*. 2012;7:249–259. doi: 10.1016/j.gheart.2012.06.015.
- Lagat DK, DeLong AK, Wellenius GA, Carter EJ, Bloomfield GS, Velazquez EJ, Hogan J, Kimaiyo S, Sherman CB. Factors associated with isolated right heart failure in women: a pilot study from western Kenya. *Glob Heart*. 2014;9:249–254. doi: 10.1016/j.gheart.2014.04.003.
- 60. Brook RD, Rajagopalan S, Pope CA 3rd, Brook JR, Bhatnagar A, Diez-Roux AV, Holguin F, Hong Y, Luepker RV, Mittleman MA, Peters A, Siscovick D, Smith SC Jr, Whitsel L, Kaufman JD; American Heart Association Council on Epidemiology and Prevention, Council on the Kidney in Cardiovascular Disease, and Council on Nutrition, Physical Activity and Metabolism. Particulate matter air pollution and cardiovascular disease: An update to the scientific statement from the American Heart Association. *Circulation*. 2010;121:2331–2378. doi: 10.1161/CIR.0b013e3181dbece1.
- 61. Zhou Z, Dionisio KL, Verissimo TG, Kerr AS, Coull B, Howie S, Arku RE, Koutrakis P, Spengler JD, Fornace K, Hughes AF, Vallarino J, Agyei-Mensah S, Ezzati M. Chemical characterization and source apportionment of household fine particulate matter in rural, peri-urban, and urban West Africa. *Environ Sci Technol.* 2014;48:1343–1351. doi: 10.1021/es404185m.
- Brauer M, Amann M, Burnett RT, Cohen A, Dentener F, Henderson SB, Krzyzanowski M, Martin R V, Van R. Disease Attributable To Outdoor Air Pollution. 2014;46:652–660.
- 63. Prüss-Üstün A, Fewtrell L, Landrigan P, Ayuso-Mateos J. Lead exposure. In: Ezzati M, Lopez A, Rodgers A, Murray C, editors. Comparative Quantification of Health Risks: Global and Regional Burden of Disease Attributable to Selected Major Risk Factors. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2004.
- Moolani Y, Bukhman G, Hotez PJ. Neglected tropical diseases as hidden causes of cardiovascular disease. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis.* 2012;6:e1499. doi: 10.1371/journal.pntd.0001499.
- 65. Nelson CP, Hamby SE, Saleheen D, Hopewell JC, Zeng L, Assimes TL, Kanoni S, Willenborg C, Burgess S, Amouyel P, Anand S, Blankenberg S, Boehm BO, Clarke RJ, Collins R, Dedoussis G, Farrall M, Franks PW, Groop L, Hall AS, Hamsten A, Hengstenberg C, Hovingh GK, Ingelsson E, Kathiresan S, Kee F, König IR, Kooner J, Lehtimäki T, März W, McPherson R, Metspalu A, Nieminen MS, O'Donnell CJ, Palmer CNA,

Peters A, Perola M, Reilly MP, Ripatti S, Roberts R, Salomaa V, Shah SH, Schreiber S, Siegbahn A, Thorsteinsdottir U, Veronesi G, Wareham N, Willer CJ, Zalloua PA, Erdmann J, Deloukas P, Watkins H, Schunkert H, Danesh J, Thompson JR, Samani NJ. Genetically determined height and coronary artery disease. *N Engl J Med.* 2015;372:1608–1618. http://www.nejm.org/doi/abs/10.1056/NEJMoa1404881. Accessed May 31, 2016.

- 66. Victora CG, Adair L, Fall C, Hallal PC, Martorell R, Richter L, Sachdev HS; Maternal and Child Undernutrition Study Group. Maternal and child undernutrition: consequences for adult health and human capital. *Lancet*. 2008;371:340–357. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(07)61692-4.
- 67. Black RE, Victora CG, Walker SP, Bhutta ZA, Christian P, de Onis M, Ezzati M, Grantham-McGregor S, Katz J, Martorell R, Uauy R; Maternal and Child Nutrition Study Group. Maternal and child undernutrition and overweight in low-income and middle-income countries. *Lancet*. 2013;382:427–451. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(13)60937-X.
- 68. GBD 2013 Mortality and Causes of Death Collaborators. Global, regional, and national age–sex specific all-cause and cause-specific mortality for 240 causes of death, 1990–2013: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2013. *Lancet*. 2015;385:117–171.
- Global Burden of Disease Study 2013 (GBD 2013). Age-Sex Specific All-Cause and Cause-Specific Mortality 1990–2013. Seattle, WA: Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation (IHME); 2014.
- Jenkins KJ, Correa A, Feinstein JA, Botto L, Britt AE, Daniels SR, Elixson M, Warnes CA, Webb CL. Noninherited risk factors and congenital cardiovascular defects: Current knowledge - A scientific statement from the American Heart Association Council on Cardiovascular Disease in the Young. *Circulation*. 2007;115:2995–3014.
- van der Bom T, Zomer AC, Zwinderman AH, Meijboom FJ, Bouma BJ, Mulder BJM. The changing epidemiology of congenital heart disease. *Nat Rev Cardiol*. 2011;8:50–60.
- Byass P, de Courten M, Graham WJ, Laflamme L, McCaw-Binns A, Sankoh OA, Tollman SM, Zaba B. Reflections on the global burden of disease 2010 estimates. *PLoS Med.* 2013;10:e1001477. doi: 10.1371/journal. pmed.1001477.
- Roth GA, Huffman MD, Moran AE, Feigin V, Mensah GA, Naghavi M, Murray CJ. Global and regional patterns in cardiovascular mortality from 1990 to 2013. *Circulation*. 2015;132:1667–1678. doi: 10.1161/ CIRCULATIONAHA.114.008720.
- 74. Forouzanfar MH, Moran AE, Flaxman AD, Roth G, Mensah GA, Ezzati M, Naghavi M, Murray CJ. Assessing the global burden of ischemic heart disease, part 2: analytic methods and estimates of the global epidemiology of ischemic heart disease in 2010. *Glob Heart*. 2012;7:331–342. doi: 10.1016/j.gheart.2012.10.003.
- Gersh BJ, Sliwa K, Mayosi BM, Yusuf S. Novel therapeutic concepts: the epidemic of cardiovascular disease in the developing world: global implications. *Eur Heart J.* 2010;31:642–648. doi: 10.1093/eurheartj/ ehq030.
- Arany Z, Elkayam U. Peripartum cardiomyopathy. *Circulation*. 2016;133:1397–1409. doi: 10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.115.020491.
- Bern C. Chagas' disease. N Engl J Med. 2015;373:456–466. doi: 10.1056/ NEJMra1410150.
- Viotti R, Vigliano CA, Alvarez MG, Lococo BE, Petti MA, Bertocchi GL, Armenti AH. The impact of socioeconomic conditions on chronic Chagas disease progression. *Rev Esp Cardiol.* 2009;62:1224–1232.
- Hidron AI, Gilman RH, Justiniano J, Blackstock AJ, Lafuente C, Selum W, Calderon M, Verastegui M, Ferrufino L, Valencia E, Tornheim JA, O'Neal S, Comer R, Galdos-Cardenas G, Bern C; Chagas Disease Working Group in Peru and Bolivia. Chagas cardiomyopathy in the context of the chronic disease transition. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis*. 2010;4:e688. doi: 10.1371/journal. pntd.0000688.
- Zühlke LJ, Steer AC. Estimates of the global burden of rheumatic heart disease. *Glob Heart*. 2013;8:189–195. doi: 10.1016/j.gheart.2013.08.008.
- van der Linde D, Konings EE, Slager MA, Witsenburg M, Helbing WA, Takkenberg JJ, Roos-Hesselink JW. Birth prevalence of congenital heart disease worldwide: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Am Coll Cardiol. 2011;58:2241–2247. doi: 10.1016/j.jacc.2011.08.025.
- 82. Murray CJ, Vos T, Lozano R, Naghavi M, Flaxman AD, Michaud C, Ezzati M, Shibuya K, Salomon JA, Abdalla S, Aboyans V, Abraham J, Ackerman I, Aggarwal R, Ahn SY, Ali MK, Alvarado M, Anderson HR, Anderson LM, Andrews KG, Atkinson C, Baddour LM, Bahalim AN, Barker-Collo S, Barrero LH, Bartels DH, Basáñez MG, Baxter A, Bell ML, Benjamin EJ, Bennett D, Bernabé E, Bhalla K, Bhandari B, Bikbov B, Bin Abdulhak A, Birbeck G, Black JA, Blencowe H, Blore JD, Blyth F, Bolliger I, Bonaventure A, Boufous S, Bourne R, Boussinesq M, Braithwaite T, Brayne C, Bridgett L, Brooker S, Brooks P, Brugha TS,

Bryan-Hancock C, Bucello C, Buchbinder R, Buckle G, Budke CM, Burch M, Burney P, Burstein R, Calabria B, Campbell B, Canter CE, Carabin H, Carapetis J, Carmona L, Cella C, Charlson F, Chen H, Cheng AT, Chou D, Chugh SS, Coffeng LE, Colan SD, Colquhoun S, Colson KE, Condon J, Connor MD, Cooper LT, Corriere M, Cortinovis M, de Vaccaro KC, Couser W, Cowie BC, Criqui MH, Cross M, Dabhadkar KC, Dahiya M, Dahodwala N, Damsere-Derry J, Danaei G, Davis A, De Leo D, Degenhardt L, Dellavalle R, Delossantos A, Denenberg J, Derrett S, Des Jarlais DC, Dharmaratne SD, Dherani M, Diaz-Torne C, Dolk H, Dorsey ER, Driscoll T, Duber H, Ebel B, Edmond K, Elbaz A, Ali SE, Erskine H, Erwin PJ, Espindola P, Ewoigbokhan SE, Farzadfar F, Feigin V, Felson DT, Ferrari A, Ferri CP, Fèvre EM, Finucane MM, Flaxman S, Flood L, Foreman K, Forouzanfar MH, Fowkes FG, Fransen M, Freeman MK, Gabbe BJ, Gabriel SE, Gakidou E, Ganatra HA, Garcia B, Gaspari F, Gillum RF, Gmel G, Gonzalez-Medina D, Gosselin R, Grainger R, Grant B, Groeger J, Guillemin F, Gunnell D, Gupta R, Haagsma J, Hagan H, Halasa YA, Hall W, Haring D, Haro JM, Harrison JE, Havmoeller R, Hay RJ, Higashi H, Hill C, Hoen B, Hoffman H, Hotez PJ, Hov D, Huang JJ, Ibeanusi SE, Jacobsen KH, James SL, Jarvis D, Jasrasaria R, Jayaraman S, Johns N, Jonas JB, Karthikeyan G, Kassebaum N, Kawakami N, Keren A, Khoo JP, King CH, Knowlton LM, Kobusingye O, Koranteng A, Krishnamurthi R, Laden F, Lalloo R, Laslett LL, Lathlean T, Leasher JL, Lee YY, Leigh J, Levinson D, Lim SS, Limb E, Lin JK, Lipnick M, Lipshultz SE, Liu W, Loane M, Ohno SL, Lyons R, Mabweijano J, MacIntyre MF, Malekzadeh R, Mallinger L, Manivannan S, Marcenes W, March L, Margolis DJ, Marks GB, Marks R, Matsumori A, Matzopoulos R. Mayosi BM, McAnulty JH, McDermott MM, McGill N, McGrath J, Medina-Mora ME, Meltzer M, Mensah GA, Merriman TR, Meyer AC, Miglioli V, Miller M, Miller TR, Mitchell PB, Mock C, Mocumbi AO, Moffitt TE, Mokdad AA, Monasta L, Montico M, Moradi-Lakeh M, Moran A, Morawska L, Mori R, Murdoch ME, Mwaniki MK, Naidoo K, Nair MN, Naldi L, Narayan KM, Nelson PK, Nelson RG, Nevitt MC, Newton CR, Nolte S, Norman P, Norman R, O'Donnell M, O'Hanlon S, Olives C, Omer SB, Ortblad K, Osborne R, Ozgediz D, Page A, Pahari B, Pandian JD, Rivero AP, Patten SB, Pearce N, Padilla RP, Perez-Ruiz F, Perico N, Pesudovs K, Phillips D, Phillips MR, Pierce K, Pion S, Polanczyk GV, Polinder S, Pope CA 3rd, Popova S, Porrini E, Pourmalek F. Prince M. Pullan RL, Ramaiah KD, Ranganathan D, Razavi H, Regan M, Rehm JT, Rein DB, Remuzzi G, Richardson K, Rivara FP, Roberts T, Robinson C, De Leòn FR, Ronfani L, Room R, Rosenfeld LC, Rushton L, Sacco RL, Saha S, Sampson U, Sanchez-Riera L, Sanman E, Schwebel DC, Scott JG, Segui-Gomez M, Shahraz S, Shepard DS, Shin H, Shivakoti R, Singh D, Singh GM, Singh JA, Singleton J, Sleet DA, Sliwa K, Smith E, Smith JL, Stapelberg NJ, Steer A, Steiner T, Stolk WA, Stovner LJ, Sudfeld C, Syed S, Tamburlini G, Tavakkoli M, Taylor HR, Taylor JA, Taylor WJ, Thomas B, Thomson WM, Thurston GD, Tleyjeh IM, Tonelli M, Towbin JA, Truelsen T, Tsilimbaris MK, Ubeda C, Undurraga EA, van der Werf MJ, van Os J, Vavilala MS, Venketasubramanian N, Wang M, Wang W, Watt K, Weatherall DJ, Weinstock MA, Weintraub R, Weisskopf MG, Weissman MM, White RA, Whiteford H, Wiebe N, Wiersma ST, Wilkinson JD, Williams HC, Williams SR, Witt E, Wolfe F, Woolf AD, Wulf S, Yeh PH, Zaidi AK, Zheng ZJ, Zonies D, Lopez AD, AlMazroa MA, Memish ZA. Disability-adjusted life years (DALYs) for 291 diseases and injuries in 21 regions, 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. Lancet. 2012;380:2197-2223. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(12)61689-4.

- Butrous G, Ghofrani HA, Grimminger F. Pulmonary vascular disease in the developing world. *Circulation*. 2008;118:1758–1766. doi: 10.1161/ CIRCULATIONAHA.107.727289.
- Mocumbi AO, Ferreira MB, Sidi D, Yacoub MH. A population study of endomyocardial fibrosis in a rural area of Mozambique. *N Engl J Med.* 2008;359:43–49. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa0708629.
- Bukhman G, Ziegler J, Parry E. Endomyocardial fibrosis: still a mystery after 60 years. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis*. 2008;2:e97. doi: 10.1371/journal. pntd.0000097.

- Commerford P, Mayosi B. An appropriate research agenda for heart disease in Africa. *Lancet*. 2006;367:1884–1886. doi: 10.1016/ S0140-6736(06)68822-3.
- Miranda JJ, Gilman RH, Smeeth L. Differences in cardiovascular risk factors in rural, urban and rural-to-urban migrants in Peru. *Heart*. 2011;97:787–796. doi: 10.1136/hrt.2010.218537.
- Scheitzer A. On the Edge of the Primeval Forest (Zwischen Wasser und Urwald). London: A & C Black; 1922.
- World Health Organization. Draft comprehensive global monitoring framework and targets for the prevention and control of noncommunicable diseases. http://apps.who.int/gb/ebwha/pdf_files/WHA66/A66_8en. pdf?ua=1. Accessed May 1, 2016.
- 90. Kontis V, Mathers CD, Bonita R, Stevens GA, Rehm J, Shield KD, Riley LM, Poznyak V, Jabbour S, Garg RM, Hennis A, Fouad HM, Beaglehole R, Ezzati M. Regional contributions of six preventable risk factors to achieving the 25 × 25 non-communicable disease mortality reduction target: a modelling study. *Lancet Glob Health*. 2015;3:e746–e757. doi: 10.1016/S2214-109X(15)00179-5.
- Roth GA, Nguyen G, Forouzanfar MH, Mokdad AH, Naghavi M, Murray CJ. Estimates of global and regional premature cardiovascular mortality in 2025. *Circulation*. 2015;132:1270–1282. doi: 10.1161/ CIRCULATIONAHA.115.016021.
- 92. Murray CJ. Choosing indicators for the health-related SDG targets. *Lancet*. 2015;386:1314–1317. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(15)00382-7.
- Binagwaho A, Muhimpundu MA, Bukhman G; NCD Synergies Group. 80 under 40 by 2020: an equity agenda for NCDs and injuries. *Lancet*. 2014;383:3–4. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(13)62423-X.
- World Heart Federation. 25x25
 RHD Goal [Internet]. http://www. world-heart-federation.org/what-we-do/rheumatic-heart-diseaserhd/25x25/. Accessed March 21, 2016.
- Mayosi BM. The 10 'Best Buys' to combat heart disease, diabetes and stroke in Africa. *Heart*. 2013;99:973–974. doi: 10.1136/ heartjnl-2013-304130.
- 96. World Health Organization Regional Office for South-East Asia. Background document for including Household Air Pollution as a Regional Target for Prevention and Control of Non-Communicable Diseases. Technical Working Group Meeting on Regional Action Plan and Targets for Prevention and Control of Noncommunicable Diseases, Bangkok, Thailand, June 11–13, 2013. Chandigarh, India: 2013
- Mirabel M, Grimaldi A, Freers J, Jouven X, Marijon E. Access to cardiac surgery in sub-Saharan Africa. *Lancet*. 2015;385:606. doi: 10.1016/ S0140-6736(15)60235-5.
- Bukhman G. Heart failure in Africa: continuity or change? *Heart*. 2014;100:1223–1224. doi: 10.1136/heartjnl-2014-305936.
- Kidder A, Kwan GF, Cancedda C, Bukhman G. Partners In Health Guide to Chronic Care Integration for Endemic Non-Communicable Diseases: Rwanda Edition. Boston, MA: Partners In Health; 2011.
- Rabkin M, El-Sadr WM. Why reinvent the wheel? Leveraging the lessons of HIV scale-up to confront non-communicable diseases. *Glob Public Health.* 2011;6:247–256. doi: 10.1080/17441692.2011.552068.
- Gupta N, Bukhman G. Leveraging the lessons learned from HIV/AIDS for coordinated chronic care delivery in resource-poor settings. *Healthc* (*Amst*). 2015;3:215–220. doi: 10.1016/j.hjdsi.2015.09.006.
- 102. Walley J, Lawn JE, Tinker A, de Francisco A, Chopra M, Rudan I, Bhutta ZA, Black RE; Lancet Alma-Ata Working Group. Primary health care: making Alma-Ata a reality. *Lancet*. 2008;372:1001–1007. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(08)61409-9.
- Raviola G, Becker AE, Farmer P. A global scope for global health– including mental health. *Lancet*. 2011;378:1613–1615. doi: 10.1016/ S0140-6736(11)60941-0.
- 104. Scaling up action against noncommunicable diseases: How much will it cost? Geneva: World Health Organization; 2011.
- Bukhman G, Mocumbi AO, Horton R. Reframing NCDs and injuries for the poorest billion: a Lancet Commission. *Lancet*. 2015;386:1221–1222. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(15)00278-0.





Endemic Cardiovascular Diseases of the Poorest Billion

Gene F. Kwan, Bongani M. Mayosi, Ana O. Mocumbi, J. Jaime Miranda, Majid Ezzati, Yogesh Jain, Gisela Robles, Emelia J. Benjamin, S. V. Subramanian and Gene Bukhman

Circulation. 2016;133:2561-2575 doi: 10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.116.008731 Circulation is published by the American Heart Association, 7272 Greenville Avenue, Dallas, TX 75231 Copyright © 2016 American Heart Association, Inc. All rights reserved. Print ISSN: 0009-7322. Online ISSN: 1524-4539

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at: http://circ.ahajournals.org/content/133/24/2561

Data Supplement (unedited) at:

http://circ.ahajournals.org/content/suppl/2016/06/13/CIRCULÁTIONAHA.116.008731.DC1.html

Permissions: Requests for permissions to reproduce figures, tables, or portions of articles originally published in *Circulation* can be obtained via RightsLink, a service of the Copyright Clearance Center, not the Editorial Office. Once the online version of the published article for which permission is being requested is located, click Request Permissions in the middle column of the Web page under Services. Further information about this process is available in the Permissions and Rights Question and Answer document.

Reprints: Information about reprints can be found online at: http://www.lww.com/reprints

Subscriptions: Information about subscribing to *Circulation* is online at: http://circ.ahajournals.org//subscriptions/

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL

Title: The Endemic Cardiovascular Diseases of the Poorest Billion

| Page 2 | The limitations of the Multi-dimensional Poverty Index (MPI) |
|---------|---|
| Page 2 | The endemic CVDs of poverty |
| Page 8 | Figure S1. Proportion of age-standardized DALYs for IHD, CVD, and NCDs by World Bank income grouping |
| Page 9 | Figure S2. Age-standardized DALYs per 100,000 population attributable to risk factor categories |
| Page 10 | Figure S3. Proportion of age-standardized DALYs attributable to risk factor categories |
| Page 11 | Table S1. Proportion of the worldwide poorest people by region |
| Page 12 | Table S2. Multidimensional poverty by individual |
| Page 17 | Table S3. Cause-specific adult mortality rates for acute and other cardiac disease by verbalautopsy |
| Page 18 | Table S4. DALYs per 100,000 for IHD, CVDs, and NCDs, age-standardized, GBD study, 2013 |
| Page 19 | Table S5. Age-standardized DALYs per 100,000 population by risk factor attribution, GBD study2013. |
| Page 20 | Table S6. Distribution of crude DALYs for CVD and congenital heart anomalies by age, GBD study2013. |
| Page 21 | Supplement References |

The limitations of the Multi-dimensional Poverty Index (MPI)

The MPI incorporates data from about 75% of the world's population. However, there are areas with no available data. The survey sources have missing data on Western China, Northern Mali, Western Sahara, Vakaga in Central African Republic, the Federally Administered Tribal Areas of Pakistan, and North and South Sinai in Egypt. These regions could not be surveyed due to on-going conflict, territorial dispute, or because they are sparsely populated. Seventeen countries with MPI data older than 2005 are excluded for comparability purposes. Most of the countries with old data are in Eastern Europe, Myanmar, and Angola. The Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative has not become acquainted with any national or internationally comparable survey for Algeria, Botswana, Cape Verde, Eritrea, Equatorial Guinea, Seychelles in Africa; Chile, Costa Rica, Cuba, El Salvador, Panama, Paraguay, Venezuela in Latin America; Iran, Lebanon, Israel, Oman and Saudi Arabia in the Middle East; or Papua New Guinea and Taiwan in the East Pacific, among other countries. Developed countries are not part of the analysis as many of the indicators are less relevant in a developed context.

The endemic CVDs of poverty

Here, we briefly summarize the epidemiology of stroke and endemic causes of heart failure in low-income countries and the poverty-related risk factors. Summarized in **table 4**, they principally include hemorrhagic and ischemic stroke and heart failure from various causes.

Stroke

Hemorrhagic stroke occurs more frequently than ischemic strokes in low-income countries. From the GBD 2013 study, hemorrhagic stroke causes 905 DALYs/100,000 people while ischemic stroke causes 521 DALYs/100,000 people in LMICs.¹ The proportion of strokes due to hemorrhage is 63% in low-income countries and 38% in high-income countries. Further, age-standardized stroke mortality and morbidity are twice as high in LMICs as in high-income countries, driven mainly by difference in hemorrhagic stroke.

Elevated blood pressure is the principal risk factor for stroke among the poor. High prevalence of hypertension and low awareness and treatment rates are major contributors to the high burden of stroke in LMICs.² The Prospective Urban Rural Epidemiology (PURE) study is a 17-country cohort including countries across the income spectrum. In low-income countries, prevalence of hypertension is high in rural settings (31.5%), though higher in urban areas (44.4%).³ Awareness, treatment, and control of hypertension were lower in low-income countries than middle-income countries, and lower in rural than urban areas. The findings suggest there is overall lack of access to basic hypertension care, particularly in rural regions where health systems may be weakest. Atherosclerosis is rare as shown in a study of 56 stroke patients in rural Tanzania where only one patient was found to have any carotid artery stenosis.⁴ Additionally, human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) was also a risk factor for stroke in urban and rural Tanzania.⁵

Hypertensive Heart Disease

Heart failure is one end-organ complication of untreated hypertension. Hypertension prevalence is highest among patients with heart failure in sub-Saharan Africa.⁶ The diagnosis is generally made among patients with a history of hypertension, particularly those people with preserved left ventricular systolic function. However, as awareness for hypertension is low in LMICs, and patients may no longer have elevated blood pressure as heart failure progresses, there may be misclassification.

Cardiomyopathies

Prior to the introduction of basic cardiac diagnostics in sub-Saharan Africa, the term "tropical cardiomyopathies" described the high prevalence of heart failure from undefined causes. ^{7,8} The underlying causes among the rural poor globally include uncontrolled HIV⁹ and other viruses, American trypanosomiasis (Chagas' disease),¹⁰ micronutrient deficiencies,¹¹ and severe chronic anemia. The vast majority of cardiomyopathies remain idiopathic.

Primary idiopathic dilated cardiomyopathies cause 20-50% of heart failure among hospitalized people in sub-Saharan Africa and Haiti (**Table 1**). Specific diagnostic studies including stress testing and coronary angiography are not generally available in rural LMICs, limiting the capacity to diagnose IHD. Nonetheless, the lack of atherosclerotic risk factors among people with cardiomyopathy suggests non-ischemic etiologies as patients with cardiomyopathies are generally young, physically active, predominantly women, thin, and non-smokers.¹²

Peripartum cardiomyopathy is a frequent cause of cardiomyopathy in populations of African descent – with hot spots in Haiti and Nigeria where the incidence is nearly 10-fold higher than in the United States.¹³ Patients with peripartum cardiomyopathy are at high risk of death in the peripartum period, leading to disruptions to family life.¹⁴ Though there is a genetic predisposition, mediating risk factors disproportionately affecting people in poverty also include multiple gestations, older age, and lack of access to birth control.

Chagas' disease one of the most common causes of non-ischemic cardiomyopathy in Latin America with about 37,000 incident cases annually.¹⁰ Chagas' disease predominantly affects the rural poor and had been characterized as a Neglected Tropical Disease.¹⁵ The protozoa which causes Chagas' disease is transmitted via insects which live in the cracks of mud huts and thatched roofs.¹⁰ Socioeconomic conditions, particularly long duration of residence in endemic regions, overcrowding, lack of medical insurance, and low education are associated with poor seroconversion and more rapid cardiomyopathy progression.^{16,17} Multinational parasite

control initiatives have reduced incidence by 70% and are cost saving.¹⁸ However, rural regions where the disease is still endemic require further population-wide strategies such as the hyperendemic Gran Chaco region shared between rural Bolivia, Paraguay, and Argentina.¹⁰

Treatment of patients with cardiomyopathies in LMICs is generally suboptimal. Few patients take the evidencebased combination of diuretic, beta-blocker, and angiotensin converting enzyme inhibitor.^{12,19,20} Subsequently, mortality is high for patients with heart failure. ^{12,20,21} Delayed access to care, poorly equipped health centers, and poorly trained healthcare staff may contribute to the high mortality in rural LMICs.

Rheumatic Heart Disease

RHD is the long-term consequence of recurrent episodes of untreated acute rheumatic fever and disproportionately affects people living in poverty. Global estimates are based on several school-based surveys. A conservative estimate suggests that 36 million people worldwide have RHD—mostly living in impoverished settings.²²

Poverty remains one of the leading causes of RHD. In sub-Saharan Africa, children with RHD are more likely to attend lower socioeconomic schools,²³ have low formal education, and have no formal employment.²⁴ In Australia's Northern Territory, the incidence of acute rheumatic fever and RHD were more than 60-times higher among poor indigenous people than non-indigenous.²⁵ Countries with higher degrees of social inequality have higher RHD prevalence.²⁶ Observational studies starting in the 1860s have shown reductions of RHD in Denmark and the United States prior to antibiotics – thought to reflect improved housing and school standards resulting in decreased crowding.^{27,28} In fact, the economic decline of former Soviet states has been associated with a concurrent rise in RHD prevalence.²⁹

Pericardial disease

Tuberculosis and untreated malignancies cause the majority of pericardial effusions in low-income countries. There are about 11 million people with tuberculosis worldwide,³⁰ and pericarditis is found on autopsy in about 1% of all tuberculosis cases.³¹ Mortality among patients with tuberculosis pericarditis is high – 26% at 6 months – which may represent the severity of the underlying illness.³² Other than treatment of the underlying condition, pericardiocentesis, and pericardiectomy, treatment options are limited. Neither reducing inflammation through glucocorticoids nor immune stimulation with heat-killed Mycobacterium were effective in randomized clinical trials.³³

Congenital Heart anomalies (CHA)

CHA accounts for nearly a third of major congenital abnormalities and is prevalent in about 8-9/1000 births.³⁴ In a multinational systematic review of patients with CHA, 34% had ventricular septal defect, 13% atrial septal defect, 10% patent ductus arteriosus, 8% pulmonic stenosis, and 5% tetralogy of Fallot.³⁴ CHA leads to more than 200,000 deaths worldwide with over 95% of the CHA deaths occur in LMICs.³⁵ Children with CHA may be more affected by lack of access to surgery and poverty. Survival among the poor is limited by delayed diagnosis and malnutrition.³⁶ More than half of the deaths can be avoided with surgical correction.³⁷ With access to appropriate medical and surgical care in developed countries, more than 90% of patient with CHA survive to adulthood.³⁸

Right heart failure

Pulmonary hypertension resulting in right heart failure (cor pulmonale) particularly affects people in LMICs. Similar to other cardiovascular conditions, available data comes from heart failure registries where 2-14% have right heart failure (**Table 1**). An estimated 20-25 million people in LMICs suffer from pulmonary hypertension.³⁹ Several pulmonary hypertension etiologies specifically affect the poor in LMICs including schistosomiasis, HIV, hemoglobinopathies such as sickle cell disease and beta thalassemia, prior pulmonary tuberculosis infection, and high altitude, and household air pollution.⁴⁰ Additionally, around 3 billion people living in LMICs are exposed to household air pollution from the use of biomass fuel and inefficient cook stoves.⁴¹ Exposure to household air pollution potentiates the effect of other endemic causes of pulmonary hypertension in LMICs.⁴² Women, who perform a majority of the cooking in poorly ventilated kitchens, endure the greatest exposure.⁴³ Improved cookstove technology can reduce exposure to air pollution in laboratory-based settings. However, distribution programs in rural LMICs have largely been ineffective primarily due to low adoption and adherence.⁴⁴

Endomyocardial Fibrosis (EMF)

EMF is a common cause of restrictive cardiomyopathy causing impaired filling of one or both ventricles. Described in 1948 in Uganda,⁴⁵ the majority of EMF cases arise in low-lying humid tropical regions including Nigeria, Ivory Coast, southern India, and Brazil.^{46,47} Though global prevalence is difficult to estimate, a community-based echocardiographic study in rural Mozambique found a population prevalence of nearly 20%, with only a quarter of cases being symptomatic.⁴⁸ The etiology of EMF remains poorly understood, though evidence points towards eosinophillic inflammation and fibrosis possibly related to parasitic infections.⁴⁷





Figure S2. Proportion of DALYs per 100,000 population attributable to risk factor categories for (A) CVD (as defined in the GBD study), and (B) all CVD including congenital heart anomalies, age-standardized, by World Bank income category, the GBD study. In the GBD study, congenital heart anomalies are not included within the CVD cause of death category, and are unattributed to any modeled risk factor.



A. CVD (GBD definition)





Figure S3. DALYs per 100,000 population attributable to risk factor categories for (A) congenital heart anomalies, (B) CVD (as defined in the GBD study), and (C) all CVD including congenital heart anomalies, age-standardized, by World Bank income category, the GBD study. In the GBD study, congenital heart anomalies are not included within the CVD cause of death category.



Table S1. Proportion of the worldwide poorest people by region.

| | Mult | idimensional po | overty* | |
|--|---------|-----------------|------------|---------------------|
| | | by | | |
| | by | sub-national | by | by |
| World Bank Region ⁺ | country | region | individual | income [#] |
| South Asia | 59.8% | 53.8% | 54.4% | 36.9% |
| Sub-Saharan Africa | 40.1% | 45.0% | 38.3% | 40.7% |
| East Asia & Pacific [§] | 0.1% | 0.3% | 5.3% | 17.6% |
| Latin America & Caribbean | 0% | 0.3% | 0.9% | 3.6% |
| Middle East & North Africa | 0% | 0.6% | 1.2% | - |
| Europe & Central Asia | 0% | 0% | 0.1% | 1.2% |
| Total number of the poorest people (billion) | 1.129 | 1.001 | 1.062 | 1.047 |

* The cut-point to define the poorest people varies by level of disaggregation: by country (MPI > 0.283), by sub-national region (MPI > 0.247); by individual (weighted deprivation score \ge 44.4%).⁴⁹

⁺ Sudan and Somalia are included in Sub-Saharan Africa using the World Bank Definition

[§] Notably, the multidimensional poverty analysis lacks sub-national data for Western China.

[#] 2012 data. Income cut-point of <\$2.05/day adjusted for 2011 purchasing power parity, except Bangladesh, Cabo Verde, Cambodia, Laos, and Jordan which use \$/day in 2005 PPP. Survey coverage for the Middle East and North Africa region is too low to report the results. The survey data does not include about 4.5% of the population in developing countries and is likely a slight underestimate. Source: The World Bank.⁵⁰

Table S2. Multidimensional poverty by individual.⁴⁹

| | | MPI data source | | М | ultidimensional | poverty | Total po | opulation | Poorest billion | | |
|------|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|----------|------|--|--|---|--------------------|---|---|---|
| Rank | Country | World Bank Region * | Survey⁺ | Year | Multidi mensio nal Poverty Index (MPI = H*A) | Headcount ratio: Population in multidimens ional poverty (H) [#] | Intensity of deprivation among the poor (A) | Population 2011 | Number of MPI poor people identified as the poorest billion in 2011 | Proportion of the poorest billion living in the country | Proportion of the population identified as the poorest billion (k≥44)) |
| | | | | | Range 0 to 1 | % Population | Average % of weighted deprivations | Thousands | Thousands | % | % |
| 1 | Niger | SSA | DHS | 2012 | 0.605 | 89.27 | 67.7 | 16,511 | 13,576 | 1.28% | 82.22% |
| 2 | Ethiopia | SSA | DHS | 2011 | 0.564 | 87.33 | 64.6 | 89,393 | 70,838 | 6.66% | 79.24% |
| 3 | South Sudan | SSA | MICS | 2010 | 0.557 | 91.09 | 61.2 | 10,381 | 8,521 | 0.80% | 82.09% |
| 4 | Chad | SSA | MICS | 2010 | 0.554 | 87.22 | 63.5 | 12,080 | 9,402 | 0.88% | 77.83% |
| 5 | Burkina Faso | SSA | DHS | 2010 | 0.535 | 84.00 | 63.7 | 15,995 | 11,417 | 1.07% | /1.38% |
| 6 | Somalia | SSA | MICS | 2006 | 0.514 | 81.16 | 63.3 | 9,908 | 7,124 | 0.67% | /1.91% |
| 7 | Sierra Leone | SSA | DHS | 2013 | 0.464 | 81.00 | 57.3 | 5,865 | 3,813 | 0.36% | 65.00% |
| 8 | Guinea-Bissau | SSA | MICS | 2006 | 0.462 | 77.54 | 59.6 | 1,624 | 1,045 | 0.10% | 64.31% |
| 9 | Guinea | SSA | DHS-MICS | 2012 | 0.459 | 75.12 | 61.1 | 11,162 | 6,843 | 0.64% | 61.31% |
| 10 | Mali | SSA | DHS | 2013 | 0.457 | //.66 | 58.9 | 14,417 | 9,161 | 0.86% | 63.54% |
| 11 | | SSA | DHS | 2010 | 0.454 | 80.78 | 56.2 | 9,540 | 6,211 | 0.58% | 65.10% |
| 12 | Central African Republic | SSA | MICS | 2010 | 0.430 | //.5/ | 55.5 | 4,436 | 2,805 | 0.26% | 63.23% |
| 13 | Congo, Democratic Republic of the | SSA | DHS | 2014 | 0.401 | 75.09 | 53.4 | 63,932 | 37,128 | 3.49% | 58.07% |
| 14 | Mozambique | SSA | DHS | 2011 | 0.389 | 69.60 | 55.9 | 24,581 | 13,891 | 1.31% | 56.51% |
| 15 | Liberia | SSA | DHS | 2013 | 0.374 | 71.23 | 52.5 | 4,080 | 2,095 | 0.20% | 51.35% |
| 16 | Uganda | SSA | DHS | 2011 | 0.367 | 69.92 | 52.5 | 35,148 | 18,267 | 1.72% | 51.97% |
| 17 | Timor-Leste | EAP | DHS | 2010 | 0.360 | 68.07 | 52.9 | 1,096 | 545 | 0.05% | 49.67% |
| 18 | Madagascar | SSA | DHS | 2009 | 0.357 | 66.88 | 53.3 | 21,679 | 11,568 | 1.09% | 53.36% |
| 19 | Afghanistan | SAR | MICS | 2011 | 0.353 | 66.16 | 53.4 | 29,105 | 13,812 | 1.30% | 47.45% |
| 20 | Rwanda | SSA | DHS | 2010 | 0.350 | 68.95 | 50.8 | 11,144 | 5,334 | 0.50% | 47.87% |
| 21 | Tanzania | SSA | DHS | 2010 | 0.332 | 65.56 | 50.7 | 46,355 | 22,374 | 2.10% | 48.27% |
| 22 | Gambia | SSA | DHS | 2013 | 0.323 | 60.35 | 53.4 | 1,735 | 783 | 0.07% | 45.13% |
| 23 | Sudan | SSA | MICS | 2010 | 0.321 | 57.80 | 55.6 | 36,431 | 16,337 | 1.54% | 44.84% |

| | | MPI data s | source | Mu | Itidimensional | poverty | Total po | opulation | Poorest billion | | |
|------|---------------|------------------------------|-----------|------|--|--|---|--------------------|---|---|---|
| Rank | Country | World Bank Region * | Survey⁺ | Year | Multidi mensio nal Poverty Index (MPI = H*A) | Headcount ratio: Population in multidimens ional poverty (H) [#] | Intensity of deprivation among the poor (A) | Population 2011 | Number of MPI poor people identified as the poorest billion in 2011 | Proportion of the poorest billion living in the country | Proportion of the population identified as the poorest billion (k≥44)) |
| | | | | | Range 0 to 1 | % Population | Average % of weighted deprivations | Thousands | Thousands | % | % |
| 24 | Cote d'Ivoire | SSA | DHS | 2012 | 0.310 | 58.75 | 52.8 | 19,390 | 8,278 | 0.78% | 42.69% |
| 25 | Senegal | SSA | DHS Cont. | 2014 | 0.309 | 56.90 | 54.3 | 13,331 | 5,434 | 0.51% | 40.76% |
| 26 | Benin | SSA | DHS | 2012 | 0.307 | 62.22 | 49.3 | 9,780 | 3,908 | 0.37% | 39.96% |
| 27 | Nigeria | SSA | DHS | 2013 | 0.303 | 53.25 | 56.8 | 164,193 | 65,478 | 6.16% | 39.88% |
| 28 | Mauritania | SSA | MICS | 2011 | 0.285 | 52.18 | 54.6 | 3,703 | 1,476 | 0.14% | 39.85% |
| 29 | India | SAR | DHS | 2006 | 0.283 | 53.75 | 52.7 | 1,221,156 | 457,334 | 43.03% | 37.45% |
| 30 | Zambia | SSA | DHS | 2014 | 0.281 | 56.56 | 49.8 | 13,634 | 5,268 | 0.50% | 38.64% |
| 31 | Malawi | SSA | DHS | 2010 | 0.265 | 56.01 | 47.4 | 15,458 | 7,202 | 0.68% | 46.60% |
| 32 | Тодо | SSA | DHS | 2014 | 0.252 | 50.10 | 50.4 | 6,472 | 2,060 | 0.19% | 31.83% |
| 33 | Haiti | LAC | DHS | 2012 | 0.248 | 49.40 | 50.3 | 10,033 | 3,329 | 0.31% | 33.18% |
| 34 | Cameroon | SSA | DHS | 2011 | 0.248 | 46.02 | 53.8 | 21,156 | 6,797 | 0.64% | 32.13% |
| 35 | Yemen | MNA | MICS | 2006 | 0.236 | 45.87 | 51.4 | 23,304 | 8,420 | 0.79% | 36.13% |
| 36 | Pakistan | SAR | DHS | 2013 | 0.230 | 44.17 | 52.1 | 176,166 | 49,988 | 4.70% | 28.38% |
| 37 | Kenya | SSA | DHS | 2009 | 0.229 | 47.81 | 48.0 | 42,028 | 12,624 | 1.19% | 30.04% |
| 38 | Nepal | SAR | DHS | 2011 | 0.217 | 44.20 | 49.0 | 27,156 | 7,503 | 0.71% | 27.63% |
| 39 | Namibia | SSA | DHS | 2013 | 0.193 | 41.96 | 46.0 | 2,218 | 525 | 0.05% | 23.66% |
| 40 | Congo | SSA | DHS | 2012 | 0.181 | 39.71 | 45.7 | 4,225 | 948 | 0.09% | 22.45% |
| 41 | Lao | EAP | MICS/DHS | 2012 | 0.174 | 34.12 | 50.9 | 6,521 | 1,429 | 0.13% | 21.91% |
| 42 | Bangladesh | SAR | DHS | 2011 | 0.174 | 37.28 | 46.6 | 152,862 | 48,970 | 4.61% | 32.04% |
| 43 | Comoros | SSA | DHS-MICS | 2012 | 0.173 | 36.04 | 47.9 | 700 | 150 | 0.01% | 21.39% |
| 44 | Ghana | SSA | MICS | 2011 | 0.156 | 33.68 | 46.2 | 24,821 | 3,741 | 0.35% | 15.07% |
| 45 | Lesotho | SSA | DHS | 2009 | 0.156 | 35.27 | 44.1 | 2,030 | 389 | 0.04% | 19.19% |
| 46 | Sao Tome | SSA | DHS | 2009 | 0.154 | 34.47 | 44.7 | 183 | 28 | 0.00% | 15.55% |
| 47 | Cambodia | EAP | DHS | 2010 | 0.146 | 33.02 | 44.3 | 14,606 | 3,291 | 0.31% | 22.53% |
| 48 | Djibouti | MNA | MICS | 2006 | 0.139 | 29.32 | 47.3 | 847 | 134 | 0.01% | 15.85% |

| | | MPI data source | | М | ultidimensional | poverty | Total po | opulation | Poorest billion | | |
|------|--------------------|------------------------------|----------|------|--|--|---|--------------------|---|---|---|
| Rank | Country | World Bank Region * | Survey⁺ | Year | Multidi mensio nal Poverty Index (MPI = H*A) | Headcount ratio: Population in multidimens ional poverty (H) [#] | Intensity of deprivation among the poor (A) | Population 2011 | Number of MPI poor people identified as the poorest billion in 2011 | Proportion of the poorest billion living in the country | Proportion of the population identified as the poorest billion (k≥44)) |
| | | | | | Range 0 to 1 | % Population | Average % of weighted deprivations | Thousands | Thousands | % | % |
| 49 | Vanatu | EAP | MICS | 2007 | 0.129 | 30.12 | 42.7 | 242 | 28 | 0.00% | 11.64% |
| 50 | Zimbabwe | SSA | MICS | 2014 | 0.127 | 29.71 | 42.7 | 13,359 | 1,839 | 0.17% | 13.77% |
| 51 | Bhutan | SAR | MICS | 2010 | 0.119 | 27.15 | 43.9 | 729 | 88 | 0.01% | 12.10% |
| 52 | Bolivia | LAC | DHS | 2008 | 0.089 | 20.45 | 43.7 | 10,324 | 1,040 | 0.10% | 10.08% |
| 53 | Swaziland | SSA | MICS | 2010 | 0.086 | 20.44 | 41.9 | 1,212 | 101 | 0.01% | 8.32% |
| 54 | Honduras | LAC | DHS | 2012 | 0.072 | 15.84 | 45.7 | 7,777 | 491 | 0.05% | 6.32% |
| 55 | Nicaragua | LAC | DHS | 2012 | 0.072 | 16.09 | 45.0 | 5,905 | 499 | 0.05% | 8.45% |
| 56 | Gabon | SSA | DHS | 2012 | 0.070 | 16.49 | 42.5 | 1,594 | 111 | 0.01% | 6.98% |
| 57 | Morocco | MNA | PAPFAM | 2011 | 0.067 | 15.43 | 43.7 | 32,059 | 2,237 | 0.21% | 6.98% |
| 58 | Indonesia | EAP | DHS | 2012 | 0.066 | 15.47 | 42.9 | 243,802 | 16,411 | 1.54% | 6.73% |
| 59 | Tajikistan | ECA | DHS | 2012 | 0.054 | 13.21 | 40.8 | 7,815 | 361 | 0.03% | 4.62% |
| 60 | Philippines | EAP | DHS | 2013 | 0.052 | 11.01 | 47.3 | 95,053 | 6,701 | 0.63% | 7.05% |
| 61 | Iraq | MNA | MICS | 2011 | 0.045 | 11.64 | 38.5 | 31,837 | 828 | 0.08% | 2.60% |
| 62 | South Africa | SSA | NIDS | 2012 | 0.044 | 11.10 | 39.5 | 51,949 | 1,681 | 0.16% | 3.24% |
| 63 | Peru | LAC | DHS-Cont | 2012 | 0.043 | 10.50 | 41.0 | 29,615 | 1,215 | 0.11% | 4.10% |
| 64 | Mongolia | EAP | MICS | 2010 | 0.037 | 9.17 | 40.7 | 2,754 | 99 | 0.01% | 3.59% |
| 65 | Guyana | LAC | DHS | 2009 | 0.030 | 7.70 | 39.2 | 791 | 17 | 0.00% | 2.13% |
| 66 | Suriname | LAC | MICS | 2010 | 0.024 | 5.88 | 40.8 | 530 | 10 | 0.00% | 1.94% |
| 67 | China | EAP | CFPS | 2012 | 0.023 | 5.24 | 43.2 | 1,368,440 | 26,526 | 2.50% | 1.94% |
| 68 | Colombia | LAC | DHS | 2010 | 0.022 | 5.38 | 40.9 | 47,079 | 844 | 0.08% | 1.79% |
| 69 | Azerbaijan | ECA | DHS | 2006 | 0.021 | 5.32 | 39.4 | 9,202 | 138 | 0.01% | 1.50% |
| 70 | Dominican Republic | LAC | DHS | 2013 | 0.020 | 5.11 | 39.0 | 10,148 | 132 | 0.01% | 1.30% |
| 71 | Trinidad&Tobago | LAC | MICS | 2006 | 0.020 | 5.62 | 35.1 | 1,333 | 5.0 | 0.00% | 0.37% |
| 72 | Maldives | SAR | DHS | 2009 | 0.018 | 5.16 | 35.6 | 332 | 1.1 | 0.00% | 0.34% |
| 73 | Belize | LAC | MICS | 2011 | 0.018 | 4.62 | 39.6 | 316 | 4.3 | 0.00% | 1.36% |

| | | | MPI data source | | Mu | ultidimensional | poverty | Total po | opulation | Poorest billion | | |
|------|------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|------|--|--|---|--------------------|---|---|---|--|
| Rank | Country | World Bank Region * | Survey [†] | Year | Multidi mensio nal Poverty Index (MPI = H*A) | Headcount ratio: Population in multidimens ional poverty (H) [#] | Intensity of deprivation among the poor (A) | Population 2011 | Number of MPI poor people identified as the poorest billion in 2011 | Proportion of the poorest billion living in the country | Proportion of the population identified as the poorest billion (k≥44)) | |
| | | | | | Range 0 to 1 | % Population | Average % of weighted deprivations | Thousands | Thousands | % | % | |
| 74 | Viet Nam | EAP | MICS | 2011 | 0.017 | 4.23 | 39.5 | 89,914 | 1,095 | 0.10% | 1.22% | |
| 75 | Syrian Arab Republic | MNA | PAPFAM | 2009 | 0.016 | 4.39 | 37.4 | 21,804 | 156 | 0.01% | 0.71% | |
| 76 | Egypt | MNA | DHS | 2014 | 0.014 | 3.56 | 38.1 | 79,392 | 457 | 0.04% | 0.58% | |
| 77 | Ecuador | LAC | ECV | 2014 | 0.013 | 3.47 | 38.5 | 15,246 | 118 | 0.01% | 0.77% | |
| 78 | Mexico | LAC | ENSANUT | 2012 | 0.011 | 2.80 | 38.8 | 119,361 | 875 | 0.08% | 0.73% | |
| 79 | Argentina | LAC | ENNyS | 2005 | 0.011 | 2.86 | 37.6 | 40,729 | 127 | 0.01% | 0.31% | |
| 80 | Brazil | LAC | PNDS | 2006 | 0.011 | 2.69 | 39.3 | 196,935 | 709 | 0.07% | 0.36% | |
| 81 | Uzbekistan | ECA | MICS | 2006 | 0.008 | 2.32 | 36.2 | 28,152 | 81 | 0.01% | 0.29% | |
| 82 | Jamaica | LAC | JSLC | 2010 | 0.008 | 2.01 | 39.4 | 2,755 | 14 | 0.00% | 0.50% | |
| 83 | Kyrgyzstan | ECA | DHS | 2012 | 0.007 | 2.03 | 36.4 | 5,403 | 13 | 0.00% | 0.24% | |
| 84 | Thailand | EAP | MICS | 2006 | 0.006 | 1.65 | 38.5 | 66,576 | 200 | 0.02% | 0.30% | |
| 85 | Jordan | MNA | DHS | 2012 | 0.006 | 1.69 | 35.0 | 6,731 | 10 | 0.00% | 0.15% | |
| 86 | Palestine, State of | MNA | MICS | 2010 | 0.006 | 1.54 | 38.3 | 4,114 | 9.1 | 0.00% | 0.22% | |
| 87 | Libya | MNA | PAPFAM | 2007 | 0.006 | 1.51 | 37.0 | 6,103 | 11 | 0.00% | 0.18% | |
| 88 | Albania | ECA | DHS | 2009 | 0.005 | 1.37 | 37.7 | 3,154 | 7.8 | 0.00% | 0.25% | |
| 89 | Tunisia | MNA | MICS | 2012 | 0.004 | 1.16 | 38.5 | 10,753 | 31 | 0.00% | 0.28% | |
| 90 | Ukraine | ECA | MICS | 2012 | 0.004 | 1.22 | 34.8 | 45,803 | 5.4 | 0.00% | 0.01% | |
| 91 | Georgia | ECA | MICS | 2005 | 0.003 | 0.80 | 35.2 | 4,374 | 3.5 | 0.00% | 0.08% | |
| 92 | Moldova | ECA | MICS | 2012 | 0.003 | 0.76 | 35.9 | 3,543 | 3.0 | 0.00% | 0.08% | |
| 93 | Macedonia | ECA | MICS | 2011 | 0.002 | 0.68 | 35.7 | 2,104 | 0.8 | 0.00% | 0.04% | |
| 94 | Bosnia and Herzegovina | ECA | MICS | 2012 | 0.002 | 0.51 | 37.3 | 3,839 | 0.2 | 0.00% | 0.01% | |
| 95 | Montenegro | ECA | MICS | 2013 | 0.001 | 0.27 | 46.4 | 621 | 0.9 | 0.00% | 0.15% | |
| 96 | Armenia | ECA | DHS | 2010 | 0.001 | 0.29 | 35.2 | 2,964 | 1.4 | 0.00% | 0.05% | |
| 97 | Serbia | ECA | MICS | 2014 | 0.001 | 0.24 | 40.5 | 9,597 | 8.0 | 0.00% | 0.08% | |
| 98 | Kazakhstan | ECA | MICS | 2011 | 0.001 | 0.18 | 36.2 | 16,098 | 2.9 | 0.00% | 0.02% | |

*EAP, East Asia and Pacific Region; ECA, Europe and Central Asia Region; LAC, Latin America and Caribbean Region; MNA, Middle East and North Africa (Arab States) Region; SAR, South Asia Region; SSA, sub-Saharan Africa Region.

[†]Data sources: CFPS, China Family Panel Studies; DHS, Demographic and Health Survey; ECV, Living Standards Survey (Ecuador); ENNyS, National Nutrition and Health Survey (Argentina); ENSANUT, National Health and Nutrition Survey (Mexico); JSLC, Jamaica Survey of Living Conditions; MICS, Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey; NIDS, National Income Dynamics Survey; PAPFAM, Pan Arab Project for Family Health; PNDS, National Demographic and Health Survey (Brazil)

[#] Weighted deprivation score \geq 33.3%.

| Table S3. Cause-specific adult mortality rates per 1000 person-years for acute and other cardiac diseases by verbal autopsy for |
|---|
| people age < 65 years at demographic and health surveillance sites, by site, and sex, 2006-2012. ⁵¹ Red shades indicate sites with |
| more acute (ischemic) than other cardiac deaths. Green shades indicate sites with less acute (ischemic) than other cardiac deaths. |

| | | | Males | | Females | | | | | |
|---------------|----------------|------------|---------|------------|------------|---------|------------|--|--|--|
| | | Acute | | % Acute | Acute | | % Acute | | | |
| | | (ischemic) | Other | (ischemic) | (ischemic) | Other | (ischemic) | | | |
| Country | Site | cardiac | cardiac | cardiac | cardiac | cardiac | cardiac | | | |
| Bangladesh | Matlab | 0.30 | 0.27 | 53% | 0.05 | 0.10 | 33% | | | |
| Bangladesh | Bandarban | 0.35 | 0.06 | 85% | - | 0.13 | - | | | |
| Bangladesh | Chakaria | 0.06 | 0.10 | 38% | 0.03 | 0.10 | 23% | | | |
| Bangladesh | АМК | 0.40 | 0.35 | 53% | 0.06 | 0.22 | 21% | | | |
| Burkina Faso | Nouna | - | - | - | 0.01 | - | - | | | |
| Burkina Faso | Ouagadougou | 0.15 | 0.06 | 71% | 0.05 | 0.06 | 45% | | | |
| Cote d'Ivoire | Taabo | 0.02 | 0.07 | 22% | 0.03 | 0.11 | 21% | | | |
| Ethiopia | Kilite Awlaelo | 0.03 | 0.07 | 30% | 0.01 | 0.06 | 14% | | | |
| The Gambia | Farafenni | 0.14 | 0.06 | 70% | 0.02 | 0.05 | 29% | | | |
| Ghana | Navrongo | 0.37 | 0.16 | 70% | 0.09 | 0.14 | 39% | | | |
| Ghana | Dodowa | 0.24 | 0.06 | 80% | 0.17 | 0.09 | 65% | | | |
| India | Ballabgarh | 0.22 | 0.12 | 65% | 0.20 | 0.07 | 74% | | | |
| India | Vadu | 0.08 | 0.07 | 53% | 0.08 | 0.15 | 35% | | | |
| Kenya | Kilifi | 0.03 | 0.15 | 17% | 0.02 | 0.14 | 13% | | | |
| Kenya | Kisumu | 0.05 | 0.39 | 11% | 0.03 | 0.38 | 7% | | | |
| Kenya | Nairobi | 1.16 | 5.61 | 17% | 1.58 | 6.25 | 20% | | | |
| Malawi | Karonga | 0.08 | 0.04 | 67% | - | 0.04 | - | | | |
| Senegal | Niakhar | 0.60 | 0.14 | 81% | 0.38 | 0.20 | 66% | | | |
| South Africa | Agincourt | 0.07 | 0.17 | 29% | 0.04 | 0.19 | 17% | | | |
| South Africa | Africa Centre | 0.12 | 0.33 | 27% | 0.06 | 0.47 | 11% | | | |
| Vietnam | Filabavi | 0.06 | 0.32 | 16% | 0.02 | 0.14 | 13% | | | |

Draft – Kwan, et al. – The Endemic Cardiovascular Diseases of the Poorest Billion

| | Poorest 16 | | Lower | Upper | | |
|-------------------------------|------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| | countries | Lower | Middle | Middle | High | |
| | | Income | Income | Income | Income | World |
| Ischemic Heart Disease (IHD) | 1,752.6 | 2,292.1 | 3,711.7 | 1,960.1 | 1,697.5 | 2,371.7 |
| Cardiovascular Disease (CVD) | 6,644.4 | 7,165.3 | 7,349.5 | 4,747.8 | 3,380.5 | 5,197.2 |
| Congenital Heart Anomalies | 356.2 | 377.5 | 406.0 | 364.7 | 142.2 | 356.4 |
| Noncommunicable Disease (NCD) | 24,455.5 | 25,282.0 | 25,301.4 | 19,793.2 | 18,446.9 | 21,420.2 |
| All Cause | 62,869.3 | 53,403.7 | 44,327.1 | 26,840.0 | 22,563.9 | 35,478.6 |

Table S4. Age-Standardized, DALYs per 100,000, the GBD study, 2013

| | | | Poorest 16 | | | | Lower middle | | Upper middle | | | | | |
|--|-------|--------------------|------------|-----------|-------|------------|-----------------|--------|-----------------|--------|-------|-------------|--------|-------|
| Risk Factor Category* | | Niger ⁺ | | countries | | Low income | | income | | income | | High income | | al |
| Congenital Heart Anomalies | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Behavioral and Metabolic risk factors Environmental/Occupational risk factors | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Unattributed | 291 | (100) | 356 | (100) | 378 | (100) | 406 | (100) | 365 | (100) | 142 | (100) | 1,290 | (100) |
| Total | 291 | | 356 | | 378 | | 406 | | 365 | | 142 | | 1,290 | |
| Cardiovascular Diseases (CVD) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Behavioral and Metabolic risk factors | 4,474 | (81) | 5,284 | (80) | 5,955 | (83) | 6,374 | (87) | 4,199 | (88) | 2,950 | (87) | 19,477 | (86) |
| Environmental/Occupational risk factors | 1,956 | (36) | 2,316 | (35) | 2,605 | (36) | 2,059 | (28) | 1,223 | (26) | 320 | (9) | 6,207 | (27) |
| Unattributed | 850 | (15) | 1,101 | (17) | 966 | (13) | 848 | (12) | 478 | (10) | 412 | (12) | 2,704 | (12) |
| Total | 5,506 | | 6,643 | | 7,165 | | 7,349 | | 4,748 | | 3,381 | | 22,642 | |
| Combined CVD and congenital heart anomalies | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Behavioral and Metabolic risk factors | 4,474 | (77) | 5,284 | (75) | 5,955 | (79) | 6,374 | (82) | 4,199 | (82) | 2,950 | (84) | 19,477 | (81) |
| Environmental/Occupational risk factors | 1,956 | (34) | 2,316 | (33) | 2,605 | (35) | 2,059 | (27) | 1,223 | (24) | 320 | (9) | 6,207 | (26) |
| Unattributed | 1,141 | (20) | 1,457 | (21) | 1,343 | (18) | 1,254 | (16) | 842 | (16) | 554 | (16) | 3,994 | (17) |
| Total | 5,797 | | 7,000 | | 7,542 | | 7,755 | | 5,112 | | 3,523 | | 23,933 | |

Table S5. Age-standardized DALYs per 100,000 population (%) by risk factor category, GBD study 2013

* The behavioral and metabolic category includes any overlap with environmental/occupational. The environmental/occupational category includes any overlap with behavioral and metabolic. Because of multicausality and the resulting overlap, the sum of the DALY rates in a given column will be greater than the total and greater that 100).

⁺ Niger is the country with the largest proportion of its population (82%) within the world's poorest billion people.

| Age group | Poorest 16 Countries | | Low-Income | | Lower-Middle Income | | Upper-Middle Income | | High Income | | Global | |
|----------------------------------|----------------------|--------|------------|--------|---------------------|--------|---------------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|
| Congenital Hea | art Anomalies | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 0-29 years | 2,395,271 | (98.9) | 4,964,197 | (97.8) | 11,183,501 | (91.9) | 7,118,714 | (93.8) | 1,012,806 | (74.6) | 24,301,292 | (92.7) |
| 30-69 years | 25,612 | (1.1) | 101,713 | (2.0) | 872,633 | (7.2) | 448,232 | (5.9) | 306,518 | (22.6) | 1,730,849 | (6.6) |
| ≥70 years | 2,029 | (0.1) | 10,694 | (0.2) | 111,970 | (0.9) | 25,786 | (0.3) | 38,324 | (2.8) | 187,073 | (0.7) |
| CVD | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 0-29 years | 1,766,114 | (17.7) | 3,696,796 | (12.0) | 11,134,350 | (8.9) | 4,710,824 | (4.4) | 1,016,318 | (1.5) | 20,588,227 | (6.2) |
| 30-69 years | 5,868,860 | (58.7) | 18,974,225 | (61.8) | 79,575,147 | (63.6) | 60,706,852 | (56.5) | 30,159,577 | (45.7) | 189,722,092 | (57.5) |
| ≥70 years | 2,364,707 | (23.6) | 8,013,319 | (26.1) | 34,324,703 | (27.5) | 42,054,014 | (39.1) | 34,787,323 | (52.7) | 119,395,307 | (36.2) |
| CVD + Congenital Heart Anomalies | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 0-29 years | 4,161,385 | (33.5) | 8,660,994 | (24.2) | 22,317,851 | (16.3) | 11,829,538 | (10.3) | 2,029,124 | (3.0) | 44,889,520 | (12.6) |
| 30-69 years | 5,894,472 | (47.4) | 19,075,938 | (53.3) | 80,447,780 | (58.6) | 61,155,084 | (53.1) | 30,466,095 | (45.3) | 191,452,941 | (53.8) |
| ≥70 years | 2,366,736 | (19.1) | 8,024,013 | (22.4) | 34,436,673 | (25.1) | 42,079,800 | (36.6) | 34,825,648 | (51.7) | 119,582,380 | (33.6) |

Table S6. Distribution of crude DALYs (%) for CVD and congenital heart anomalies by age and World Bank income group, all ages, GBD study 2013.

References

- Feigin VL, Krishnamurthi R V., Parmar P, Norrving B, Mensah GA, Bennett DA, Barker-Collo S, Moran AE, Sacco RL, Truelsen T, Davis S, Pandian JD, Naghavi M, Forouzanfar MH, Nguyen G, Johnson CO, Vos T, Meretoja A, Murray CJL, Roth GA. Update on the Global Burden of Ischemic and Hemorrhagic Stroke in 1990-2013: The GBD 2013 Study. *Neuroepidemiology*. 2015;45:161–176.
- Ibrahim MM, Damasceno A. Hypertension in developing countries. *Lancet*. 2012;380:611–9.
- 3. Chow CK, Teo KK, Rangarajan S, Islam S, Gupta R, Avezum A, Bahonar A, Chifamba J, Dagenais G, Diaz R, Kazmi K, Lanas F, Wei L, Lopez-Jaramillo P, Fanghong L, Ismail NH, Puoane T, Rosengren A, Szuba A, Temizhan A, Wielgosz A, Yusuf R, Yusufali A, McKee M, Liu L, Mony P, Yusuf S. Prevalence, awareness, treatment, and control of hypertension in rural and urban communities in high-, middle-, and low-income countries. JAMA. 2013;310:959–68.
- 4. Jusabani A, Gray WK, Swai M, Walker R. Post-stroke carotid ultrasound findings from an incident Tanzanian population. *Neuroepidemiology*. 2011;37:245–8.
- Walker RW, Jusabani A, Aris E, Gray WK, Unwin N, Swai M, Alberti G, Mugusi F. Stroke risk factors in an incident population in urban and rural Tanzania: a prospective, community-based, case-control study. *Lancet Glob Heal*. 2013;1:e282–e288.
- Khatibzadeh S, Farzadfar F, Oliver J, Ezzati M, Moran A. Worldwide risk factors for heart failure: A systematic review and pooled analysis. Int. J. Cardiol. 2013;168:1186–1194.
- 7. Shaper AG. On the nature of some tropical cardiomyopathies. *Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg*. 1967;61:458–81.
- 8. Ikeme A. Idiopathic cardiomegaly in Africa. In: Akinkugbe OO, editor. Cardiovascular Disease in Africa. Basel: Ciba-Geigy; 1978.
- 9. Syed FF, Sani MU. Recent advances in HIV-associated cardiovascular diseases in Africa. *Heart*. 2013;99:1146–53.
- 10. Bern C. Chagas' Disease. N Engl J Med. 2015;373:456–466.
- 11. Seftel HC, Metz J, Lakier JB. Cardiomyopathies in Johannesburg Bantu. I. Aetiology and characteristics of beriberi heart disease. *S Afr Med J*. 1972;46:1707–13.
- Damasceno A, Mayosi BM, Sani M, Ogah OS, Mondo C, Ojji D, Dzudie A, Kouam CK, Suliman A, Schrueder N, Yonga G, Ba SA, Maru F, Alemayehu B, Edwards C, Davison B a, Cotter G, Sliwa K. The causes, treatment, and outcome of acute heart failure in 1006 Africans from 9 countries. *Arch Intern Med*. 2012;172:1386–94.
- 13. Arany Z, Elkayam U. Peripartum Cardiomyopathy. *Circulation*. 2016;133:1397–1409.
- Sliwa K, Libhaber E, Elliott C, Momberg Z, Osman A, Zühlke L, Lachmann T, Nicholson L, Thienemann F, Roos-Hesselink J, Anthony J. Spectrum of cardiac disease in maternity in a low-resource cohort in South Africa. *Heart*. 2014;100:1967–74.
- 15. WHO | Neglected tropical diseases Summary [Internet]. 2015 [cited 2016 Feb

22];Available from:

http://www.who.int/neglected_diseases/diseases/summary/en/

- 16. Viotti R, Vigliano CA, Álvarez MG, Lococo BE, Petti MA, Bertocchi GL, Armenti AH. The Impact of Socioeconomic Conditions on Chronic Chagas Disease Progression. *Rev Española Cardiol (English Ed.* 2009;62:1224–1232.
- Hidron AI, Gilman RH, Justiniano J, Blackstock AJ, Lafuente C, Selum W, Calderon M, Verastegui M, Ferrufino L, Valencia E, Tornheim JA, O'Neal S, Comer R, Galdos-Cardenas G, Bern C, Chagas Disease Working Group in Peru and Bolivia. Chagas cardiomyopathy in the context of the chronic disease transition. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis*. 2010;4:e688.
- Moncayo A. Chagas disease: current epidemiological trends after the interruption of vectorial and transfusional transmission in the Southern Cone countries. *Memórias do Inst Oswaldo Cruz*. 2003;98:577–91.
- 19. Dokainish H, Teo K, Zhu J, Roy A, AlHabib KF, ElSayed A, Palileo-Villaneuva L, Lopez-Jaramillo P, Karaye K, Yusoff K, Orlandini A, Sliwa K, Mondo C, Lanas F, Prabhakaran D, Badr A, Elmaghawry M, Damasceno A, Tibazarwa K, Belley-Cote E, Balasubramanian K, Yacoub MH, Huffman MD, Harkness K, Grinvalds A, McKelvie R, Yusuf S. Heart Failure in Africa, Asia, the Middle East and South America: The INTER-CHF study. *Int J Cardiol*. 2016;204:133–141.
- Kwan GF, Jean-Baptiste W, Cleophat P, Leandre F, Louine M, Luma M, Benjamin EJ, Mukherjee JS, Bukhman G, Hirschhorn LR. Descriptive epidemiology and short-term outcomes of heart failure hospitalisation in rural Haiti. *Heart*. 2016;102:140–6.
- 21. Ntusi NBA, Badri M, Gumedze F, Wonkam A, Mayosi BM. Clinical characteristics and outcomes of familial and idiopathic dilated cardiomyopathy in Cape Town: A comparative study of 120 cases followed up over 14 years. *South African Med J*. 2011;101:399–404.
- 22. Zühlke LJ, Steer AC. Estimates of the Global Burden of Rheumatic Heart Disease. *Glob Heart*. 2013;8:189–195.
- Beaton A, Okello E, Lwabi P, Mondo C, McCarter R, Sable C. Echocardiography screening for rheumatic heart disease in Ugandan schoolchildren. *Circulation*. 2012;125:3127–32.
- Zhang W, Mondo C, Okello E, Musoke C, Kakande B, Nyakoojo W, Kayima J, Freers J. Presenting features of newly diagnosed rheumatic heart disease patients in Mulago Hospital: a pilot study. *Cardiovasc J Afr.* 2013;24:28–33.
- 25. Lawrence JG, Carapetis JR, Griffiths K, Edwards K, Condon JR. Acute rheumatic fever and rheumatic heart disease: incidence and progression in the Northern Territory of Australia, 1997 to 2010. *Circulation*. 2013;128:492–501.
- 26. Rothenbühler M, O'Sullivan CJ, Stortecky S, Stefanini GG, Spitzer E, Estill J, Shrestha NR, Keiser O, Jüni P, Pilgrim T. Active surveillance for rheumatic heart disease in endemic regions: a systematic review and meta-analysis of prevalence among children and adolescents. *Lancet Glob Heal*. 2014;2:e717–e726.
- 27. World Health Organization Joint WHO/ISFC Meeting on Rheumatic Fever/Rheumatic Heart Disease Control, with Emphasis on Primary Prevention.

Geneva, 7-9 September 1994. WHO/CVD/94.1.

- 28. Labarthe D. Epidemiology and Prevention of Cardiovascular Diseases: A Global Challenge. 2nd ed. Sudbury, Massachusetts: Jones and Bartlett Publishers; 2011.
- 29. Omurzakova NA, Yamano Y, Saatova GM, Mirzakhanova MI, Shukurova SM, Kydyralieva RB, Jumagulova AS, Seisenbaev AS, Nishioka K, Nakajima T. High incidence of rheumatic fever and rheumatic heart disease in the republics of Central Asia. *Int J Rheum Dis*. 2009;12:79–83.
- 30. Murray CJL, Ortblad KF, Guinovart C, Lim SS, Wolock TM, Roberts DA, Dansereau EA, Graetz N, Barber RM, Brown JC, Wang H, Duber HC, Naghavi M, Dicker D, Dandona L, Salomon JA, Heuton KR, Foreman K, Phillips DE, Fleming TD, Flaxman AD, Phillips BK, Johnson EK, Coggeshall MS, Abd-Allah F, Abera SF, Abraham JP, Abubakar I, Abu-Raddad LJ, Abu-Rmeileh NM, Achoki T, Adeyemo AO, Adou AK, Adsuar JC, Agardh EE, Akena D, Al Kahbouri MJ, Alasfoor D, Albittar MI, Alcalá-Cerra G, Alegretti MA, Alemu ZA, Alfonso-Cristancho R, Alhabib S, Ali R, Alla F, Allen PJ, Alsharif U, Alvarez E, Alvis-Guzman N, Amankwaa AA, Amare AT, Amini H, Ammar W, Anderson BO, Antonio CAT, Anwari P, Ärnlöv J, Arsic Arsenijevic VS, Artaman A, Asghar RJ, Assadi R, Atkins LS, Badawi A, Balakrishnan K, Banerjee A, Basu S, Beardsley J, Bekele T, Bell ML, Bernabe E, Beyene TJ, Bhala N, Bhalla A, Bhutta ZA, Bin Abdulhak A, Binagwaho A, Blore JD, Bora Basara B, Bose D, Brainin M, Breitborde N, Castañeda-Orjuela CA, Catalá-López F, Chadha VK, Chang JC, Chiang PPC, Chuang TW, Colomar M, Cooper LT, Cooper C, Courville KJ, Cowie BC, Criqui MH, Dandona R, Dayama A, De Leo D, Degenhardt L, et al. Global, regional, and national incidence and mortality for HIV, tuberculosis, and malaria during 1990-2013: A systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2013. Lancet. 2014;384:1005-1070.
- 31. Fowler NO. Tuberculous pericarditis. *JAMA*. 1991;266:99–103.
- 32. Mayosi BM, Wiysonge CS, Ntsekhe M, Gumedze F, Volmink JA, Maartens G, Aje A, Thomas BM, Thomas KM, Awotedu AA, Thembela B, Mntla P, Maritz F, Blackett KN, Nkouonlack DC, Burch VC, Rebe K, Parrish A, Sliwa K, Vezi BZ, Alam N, Brown BG, Gould T, Visser T, Magula NP, Commerford PJ. Mortality in patients treated for tuberculous pericarditis in sub-Saharan Africa. *S Afr Med J*. 2008;98:36–40.
- 33. Mayosi BM, Ntsekhe M, Bosch J, Pandie S, Med MM, Jung H, Gumedze F, Pogue J, Thabane L, Smieja M, Francis V, Joldersma L, Thomas KM, Thomas B, Awotedu A a, Magula NP, Naidoo DP, Damasceno A, Banda AC, Brown B, Manga P, Kirenga B, Mondo C, Mntla P, Tsitsi JM, Peters F, Essop MR, Russell JBW, Hakim J, Matenga J, Barasa AF, Sani MU, Olunuga T, Ogah O, Ansa V, Aje A, Danbauchi S, Ojji D, Yusuf S. Prednisolone and Mycobacterium indicus pranii in Tuberculous Pericarditis. N Engl J Med. 2014;
- Van Der Linde D, Konings EEM, Slager MA, Witsenburg M, Helbing WA, Takkenberg JJM, Roos-Hesselink JW. Birth prevalence of congenital heart disease worldwide: A systematic review and meta-analysis. J Am Coll Cardiol. 2011;58:2241–2247.
- 35. Murray CJL, Vos T, Lozano R, Naghavi M, Flaxman AD, Michaud C, Ezzati M, Shibuya K, Salomon JA, Abdalla S, Aboyans V, Abraham J, Ackerman I, Aggarwal R,

Ahn SY, Ali MK, Alvarado M, Anderson HR, Anderson LM, Andrews KG, Atkinson C, Baddour LM, Bahalim AN, Barker-Collo S, Barrero LH, Bartels DH, Basáñez M-G, Baxter A, Bell ML, Benjamin EJ, Bennett D, Bernabé E, Bhalla K, Bhandari B, Bikbov B, Bin Abdulhak A, Birbeck G, Black JA, Blencowe H, Blore JD, Blyth F, Bolliger I, Bonaventure A, Boufous S, Bourne R, Boussinesg M, Braithwaite T, Brayne C, Bridgett L, Brooker S, Brooks P, Brugha TS, Bryan-Hancock C, Bucello C, Buchbinder R, Buckle G, Budke CM, Burch M, Burney P, Burstein R, Calabria B, Campbell B, Canter CE, Carabin H, Carapetis J, Carmona L, Cella C, Charlson F, Chen H, Cheng AT-A, Chou D, Chugh SS, Coffeng LE, Colan SD, Colquhoun S, Colson KE, Condon J, Connor MD, Cooper LT, Corriere M, Cortinovis M, de Vaccaro KC, Couser W, Cowie BC, Criqui MH, Cross M, Dabhadkar KC, Dahiya M, Dahodwala N, Damsere-Derry J, Danaei G, Davis A, De Leo D, Degenhardt L, Dellavalle R, Delossantos A, Denenberg J, Derrett S, et al. Disability-adjusted life years (DALYs) for 291 diseases and injuries in 21 regions, 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. Lancet. 2012;380:2197-223.

- 36. Saxena A. Congenital cardiac surgery in the less privileged regions of the world. *Expert Rev Cardiovasc Ther*. 2009;7:1621–9.
- 37. Higashi H, Barendregt JJ, Kassebaum NJ, Weiser TG, Bickler SW, Vos T. The burden of selected congenital anomalies amenable to surgery in low and middle-income regions: cleft lip and palate, congenital heart anomalies and neural tube defects. *Arch Dis Child*. 2015;100:233–8.
- van der Bom T, Zomer AC, Zwinderman AH, Meijboom FJ, Bouma BJ, Mulder BJM. The changing epidemiology of congenital heart disease. *Nat Rev Cardiol*. 2011;8:50–60.
- 39. Butrous G, Ghofrani HA, Grimminger F. Pulmonary vascular disease in the developing world. *Circulation*. 2008;118:1758–1766.
- 40. Bloomfield GS, Lagat DK, Akwanalo OC, Carter EJ, Lugogo N, Vedanthan R, Velazquez EJ, Kimaiyo S, Sherman CB. Waiting to inhale: An exploratory review of conditions That Predispose to Pulmonary Hypertension and Right Heart Failure in Persons Exposed to Household Air Pollution in LMIC. *Glob Heart*. 2012;7:249–259.
- 41. World Health Organization. Household air pollution and health. Fact Sheet number 292 [Internet]. [cited 2016 Mar 1];Available from: http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs292/en/
- 42. Bloomfield GS, Lagat DK, Akwanalo OC, Carter EJ, Lugogo N, Vedanthan R, Velazquez EJ, Kimaiyo S, Sherman CB. Conditions that predispose to pulmonary hypertension and right heart failure in persons exposed to household air pollution in LMIC. *Glob Heart*. 2012;7:249–259.
- 43. Lagat DK, DeLong AK, Wellenius G a., Carter EJ, Bloomfield GS, Velazquez EJ, Hogan J, Kimaiyo S, Sherman CB. Factors Associated With Isolated Right Heart Failure in Women. *Glob Heart*. 2014;9:249–254.
- 44. Lewis JJ, Pattanayak SK. Who adopts improved fuels and cookstoves? A systematic review. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2012;120:637–45.
- 45. Davies J. Endomyocardial fibrosis in Uganda. *East Afr Med J*. 1948;25:10–16.

- 46. Mocumbi AO, Yacoub S, Yacoub MH. Neglected tropical cardiomyopathies: II. Endomyocardial fibrosis: myocardial disease. *Heart*. 2008;94:384–390.
- 47. Bukhman G, Ziegler J, Parry E. Endomyocardial fibrosis: still a mystery after 60 years. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis*. 2008;2:e97.
- 48. Mocumbi AO, Ferreira MB, Sidi D, Yacoub MH. A population study of endomyocardial fibrosis in a rural area of Mozambique. *N Engl J Med*. 2008;359:43–9.
- 49. Alkire S, Robles G. Multidimensional Poverty Index 2015: Brief Methodological Note and Results. 2015.
- 50. The World Bank. PovcalNet [Internet]. [cited 2016 May 25];Available from: http://iresearch.worldbank.org/PovcalNet/
- 51. Streatfield PK, Khan WA, Bhuiya A, Lankoande B, Zabre P, Douillot L. Adult noncommunicable disease mortality in Africa and Asia : evidence from INDEPTH Health and Demographic Surveillance System sites Adult non-communicable disease mortality in Africa and Asia : evidence from INDEPTH Health and Demographic Surveillance Sy. 2015;25365.